

## Notes

---

### Chapter 1: Pater in the 1990s, *Laurel Brake & Ian Small*

1. Rene Wellek, *A History of Modern Criticism*, vol. 4 *The Later Nineteenth Century* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1965), 381.

### Chapter 2: Estrangement and Connection: Walter Pater, Benjamin Jowett, and William M. Hardinge, *Billie Andrew Inman*

1. Thomas Wright, *The Life of Walter Pater*. 2 vols. (London: Everett, 1907), I, 255-56.
2. Laurel Brake, "Judas and the Widow: Thomas Wright and A. C. Benson as Biographers of Walter Pater: The Widow," *Prose Studies*, 4 (1981), 48. The essay is reprinted in Philip Dodd, ed., *Walter Pater: An Imaginative Sense of Fact* (London: Frank Cass, 1981), 39-54. The passages from Benson's *Diary* discussed by Brake have been printed by R. M. Seiler in *Walter Pater: A Life Remembered* (Calgary, Alberta: University of Calgary, 1987), 253-61.
3. Richard Ellmann, "Oscar at Oxford," *New York Review*, 29 March 1984, 26.
4. *Ibid.*
5. Richard Ellmann, *Oscar Wilde* (New York: Knopf, 1988), 60-61.
6. *Ibid.*, 60.
7. In a telephone conversation in November 1985, Richard Ellmann directed me to Dr. Kadish, who directed me to the Gell family and to Hardinge's article on Jowett cited herein. I express gratitude to Dr. Kadish and to Major Gell, who provided

the letters for me to read and gave me permission to quote from them and photocopy them. The series of letters from the Gell Correspondence that I cite are the *B* series (Arnold Toynbee), and the MIL series (Alfred Milner). The letters have been laminated, arranged by dates, numbered, and placed in manila envelopes. I read Toynbee's letters to Philip Lyttleton Gell, 1873-1881; Jowett's letters to Gell 1873-1892 [Series A; none cited]; and Milner's to Gell, 1873-1879. MIL 6, 7, and 8, the most pertinent to the paper, are in an envelope labelled 1874. The numbers and dates correspond to those given in the *National Register of Archives*, listed by T. W. M. Jaine for the Royal Commission on Historical Manuscripts in 1975, of which the Derbyshire County Record Office in Matlock has a copy. Much of the correspondence is of a business type, related mainly to the British South Africa Company. The personal correspondence is in Section VI: Correspondence Mostly Between P. L. Gell and Alfred Milner (cr. Viscount Milner, 1902). Most of the pertinent letters are in subdivision HMC/64. Milner also saved an extensive body of correspondence which is now held by the Bodleian Library and indexed in a separate *Catalogue*. However, no letters pertaining to Hardinge are indexed.

8. Hardinge states that he "had the misfortune to lose both . . . [his] parents in ten months" (William Money Hardinge, "Some Personal Recollections of the Master of Balliol," *Temple Bar* 103 [October 1894]; repr. in *Littel's Living Age* 203 [1 December 1894], 557), and that after his father's death he "paid the master a visit of many days at his own house, dating from Monday, February 28th, 1876 . . . a visit during which his house was literally mine, whether he was there or away." The death date of Hardinge's father, Henry Hardinge, M.D., is given in the *Calendar of the Grants of Probate and Letters of Administration Made in the Probate Registries* (London, 1876) at Somerset House, London, as 28 January 1876. Milner tells Gell on 6 February 1876: "Hardinge has lost his father great loss I should think" (MIL 1/20). Hardinge's mother, Jane Hardinge, had died on 26 March 1875 of cerebral hemorrhage, with her son present (death certificate from St. Catherine's House, London).

9. Ellmann, *Oscar Wilde*, 60.

10. John Dixon Hunt places the beginning of the road project at Hinksey in the spring of 1874 (*The Wider Sea: A Life of John Ruskin* [London: Dent, 1982], 350), and Alon Kadish dates the first planning meeting on 16 March 1874 (Alon Kadish, *The Life and Death of Arnold Toynbee, 1852-1883* [Durham: Duke University Press, 1986], 34.)

11. Ellmann, *Oscar Wilde*, 61.

12. William Money Hardinge, "Some Personal Recollections of the Master of Balliol," *Littel's Living Age*, 557.

13. Gell Correspondence, B1/1.

14. Ibid., MIL 1/6.

15. B 1/2. This paragraph continues as follows: "Milner will tell you more: now [next word smudged] but his real friends know the circumstances & of course you will say nothing about them: Hardinge was really very grateful to you for all your kindness & seemed to feel your not being up during the matter very much: he had a sort of wish to go down by the same sea-side place as you: but I fancy there are very strong objections which you will understand: though I think in some respects the plan is a good one. Especially I don't think for your sake, in your present state of health it would be at all good, though you know best about that, of course." Toynbee's letter, with full date, 11 March 1874, contains this line: "Hardinge seemed very sensible to your kind offer to go with him to the sea." But apparently they did not go. Toynbee wrote Gell on 9 April 1874: "Will you write to Hardinge? He is lonely I'm afraid, though his never-ending doubleness of which he seems hardly conscious is reason enough for men ceasing to have to do with him but nothing but infinite patience from the few of us who have tried to help him can save him for his father plainly says he will turn him from the house if anything of the kind happens again and if that does happen God knows what will become of him." B 1/3.

16. MIL 1/6.

17. MIL 1/7.

18. MIL 1/8.

19. Hardinge, "Some Personal Recollections of the Master of Balliol," 557.

20. Ibid., 554.

21. Ibid., 561.

22. Bodleian MS. Eng. misc. e 459, from 17 January 1874.

23. It has been suggested "Miss Pater" might refer to Pater himself. I do not think so. Such a usage would have been out of keeping with the style of Milner's letters. Although Milner was capable of levity, irony, and sarcasm, he treats Hardinge's crisis consistently with straightforward seriousness. Also, I think that if Pater had been trying to send Hardinge home, Milner would have felt prompted to comment either on Pater's duplicity or Hardinge's misinterpretation of the relationship. In the nineteenth century "Miss" was the title of the eldest unmarried sister; I therefore thought at first that Hester, not Clara, would have been "Miss Pater."

However, Sir Michael Levey has convinced me that the sister who took action is more likely to have been Clara than Hester: "Although of course Miss Pater was, as you say, the proper form for referring to the elder sister, anyone not aware of her or of the sisters' ages *might* have referred in that way to Clara. . . . To illustrate . . . I cite Wilde's letter to Wemyss Reid (Hart-Davis, 1962, 195), where he writes of hoping to get among contributors to the *Lady's World*, in 1887, 'Miss Pater,' where surely he meant Clara? Clara's gravitating all the time towards university circles is possibly another pointer to considering if it was she who became involved" (Letter dated 21 August 1988).

24. Leonard Montefiore was destined to have an even shorter life than Arnold Toynbee. After studying law, he returned to Balliol and took his B.A. in 1878. Then he went out to Newport, Rhode Island, where in 1879 he died.

25. Mallock had taken the B.A. in 1874, but apparently had remained at Oxford. He had never lodged in college. Book I, Chapter I-III, of *The New Republic* would appear in *Belgravia* four months later, or June 1876, and the serial publication would extend to December. Mallock, who had won the Newdigate Prize for Poetry in 1871, had published *Every Man His Own Poet, The Inspired Singer's Recipe Book* in 1872, in which he had given the recipe for writing a poem like Tennyson, Browning, Arnold, and others. He had by this time written most of the poems that were to appear in *Poems by William Hurrell Mallock* (New York: George W. Fitch, 1880). While *The New Republic* was appearing in *Belgravia*, he published an article entitled "The Golden Ass of Apuleius" in *Fraser's Magazine* (n.s. 14 [1876], 363-74). He published his central philosophical book, *Is Life Worth Living?* (New York: John Wurtels Lovell), dedicated to Ruskin, in 1880. Mallock believed that unless modern man could find a new basis for religious faith, he would sink deeper and deeper into misery. The position that he advocates in this book is exactly that described by Pater in "The Will as Vision" in *Marius the Epicurean*, the only difference being that Marius was able to effect the will to believe only once or twice and Mallock thought it to be the only acceptable state of mind.

26. MIL 1/20.

27. Wright, *The Life of Walter Pater*, I, 256.

28. William Hurrell Mallock, *Memoirs of Life and Literature* (New York and London: Harper, 1920), 67.

29. *Ibid.*, 79.

30. *Ibid.*, 80-82.

31. Ibid., 87.

32. *The New Republic, or, Culture, Faith and Philosophy in an English Country House*, 2 vols. (London: Chatto and Windus, 1877); see especially I, 22, 134, 163; II, 136, 144, 158, 179.

33. Ibid., II, 130.

34. *Monumens du culte secret des dames romaines, pour servir de suite aux Monumens de la vie privée des XII Césars* [by Pierre François Hugues, called d'Hancarville], who states that it was published by Sabellus in Caprée, in 1784. For a discussion of this book, see my "Laurence's Uncle's Book, or Shades of Baron d'Hancarville in Mallock's *New Republic*," *ELT Special Series No. 4* (1990), 67-76.

35. Geoffrey Faber, *Jowett: A Portrait with a Background* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1957), 378.

36. Ibid.

37. Ibid., and Mallock, *The New Republic*, I, 14.

38. [Charles Edward Hutchinson], *Boy-Worship* (Oxford, 1880), 12-13.

39. The remainder of the sonnet is as follows:

One was Narcissus by a wood-side well,  
 And on the moss his limbs and feet were white;  
 And one, Queen Venus, blown in for my delight  
 Across the blue sea in a rosy shell;  
 And one, a lean Aquinas in his cell,  
 Kneeling, his pen in hand, with aching sight  
 Strained towards a carven Christ; and of these  
 three  
 I knew not which was fairest. First I turned  
 Towards the soft boy, who laughed and fled from  
 me;  
 Towards Venus then; and she smiled once, and she  
 Fled also. Then with teeming heart I yearned,  
 O Angel of the Schools, towards Christ with thee!  
 (II, 130-31)

Either Hardinge or Mallock was capable of writing this sonnet, but presumably Mallock wrote it, since it is a part of his book and since it expresses a type of

eclecticism that was anathema to him.

40. Faber, *Jowett: A Portrait with a Background*, 92-93.

41. "Some Personal Recollections of the Master of Balliol," 557-60.

42. Watts-Dunton, quoted by Oswald Doughty in *Dante Gabriel Rossetti: A Victorian Romantic*, 2nd ed. (London: Oxford University Press, 1960), 616.

43. Evelyn Abbott and Lewis Campbell, *The Life and Letters of Benjamin Jowett*, 3 vols. (New York: E. P. Dutton, 1897), II, 111.

44. "Some Personal Recollections of the Master of Balliol," 557.

45. *Ibid.*, 562.

46. William Money Hardinge, *Clifford Gray: A Romance of Modern Life* (London: Smith, Elder, 1881), 80-81.

47. If Raffalovich's use of *saw* in this passage is literal, the reference cannot be to Hardinge's first encounter with Pater, since Raffalovich was only ten years old in 1874.

48. Alexander Michaelson [Marc André Raffalovich], "Walter Pater. In Memoriam," *Blackfriars*, 9 (1928), 469-70.

49. "The Myth of Demeter and Persephone," *Greek Studies* (London: Macmillan, 1895), 108.

50. *Pater and His Reading, 1874-1877, with a Bibliography of His Library Borrowings, 1878-1894* (New York: Garland, 1990), especially pp. xxiv-xxxiii, 140, 204.

51. Walter Pater, *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry*, 2nd ed. (London: Macmillan, 1877), 7-8.

### **Chapter 3: Editing Pater's *Gaston de Latour*: The Unfinished Work as "A Fragment of Perfect Expression", *Gerald Monsman***

1. Walter Pater, *Gaston De Latour* (London: Macmillan, 1896), "Preface."

2. Elizabeth Falsey, "Special Collections Report: The Pater Manuscripts at Houghton, Harvard University," *English Literature in Transition*, 27:2 (1984), 155.
3. Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean* (London, Macmillan, 1910), I, 9.
4. Charles Lamb, "Oxford in the Vacation," *The Essays of Elia in The Works of Charles Lamb* (Edition de Luxe), Alfred Ainger, ed. (London: Chesterfield Society, 1883), 18, 300.
5. William Sharp, "Some Personal Reminiscences of Walter Pater," *Atlantic Monthly*, 74 (December 1894), 805.
6. Hans Walter Gabler, ed. James Joyce, *Ulysses: The Corrected Text* (New York: Vintage Books, 1984), 649-50.
7. Hans Walter Gabler, ed. James Joyce, *Ulysses: A Critical and Synoptic Edition* (New York: Garland, 1984), III, 1892-95.
8. Letter of April or May 1894, *Letters of Walter Pater*, Lawrence Evans, ed. (Oxford: Clarendon, 1970), 153, n.2.
9. Gosse, "Walter Pater," *Critical Kit-Kats* (London: Heinemann, 1896), 262-64.
10. Unpublished correspondence, Bodelian Library, University of Oxford. See also Shadwell's letter to Clara of 7 September 1894 and his preface to *Greek Studies* (1896).

## **Chapter 4: Editing and Annotating Pater, Ian Small**

1. See G. Thomas Tanselle, "Textual Criticism and Deconstruction," *Studies in Bibliography*, 43, (1990), 1-33.
2. The Pater correspondence in Macmillan archive in the British Library contains no reference to any edition after the 1892.
3. For example, the editions by Parker, Tuell, and Levey follow the Library edition, but for different and quite implausible reasons. See Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean*, E. Adams Parker, ed. (London: Macmillan, 1931); Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean*, Anne Kimball Tuell, ed. (New York: Macmillan, 1926); and Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean*, Michael Levey, ed. (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1985).

4. G. Thomas Tanselle, "The Editorial Problem of Final Authorial Intention," *Studies in Bibliography*, 29 (1976), 169.
5. Jerome McGann, "Shall These Bones Live?" in *The Beauty of Inflections* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985), 91. McGann does offer a systematic programme for taking full account of the history of a text.
6. See Michael Black, "Editing a Constantly-Revising Author: The Cambridge Edition of Lawrence in Historical Context," in *D.H. Lawrence Centenary Essays*, Mara Kalnins, ed. (Bristol: Bristol Classical Press, 1986).
7. Hans Walter Gabler, "The Synchrony and Diachrony of Texts: Practice and Theory of the Critical Edition of James Joyce's *Ulysses*," *TEXT*, 1 (1981), 305-26.
8. See, in particular, Claire Badaracco, "The Editor and the Question of Value: Proposal," *TEXT*, 1 (1981), 41-43; and Fredson Bowers, "The Editor and the Question of Value: Another View," *TEXT*, 1 (1981), 45-73.
9. See Ian Small, "Critical Opinion: Annotating 'Hard' Nineteenth-Century Novels," *Essays in Criticism*, 36 (1986), 281-93.
10. Walter Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies* (London: Macmillan, 1895), 184.
11. Martin C. Battestin, "A Rationale of Literary Annotation: The Example of Fielding's Novels," *Studies in Bibliography*, 34 (1981), 1-22.
12. *Ibid.*, 19-20.
13. See Ian Jack, "Novels and Those 'Necessary Evils': Annotating the Brontës," *Essays in Criticism*, 32 (1982), 320-30; and Stephen Wall, "Annotated English Novels?," *Essays in Criticism*, 32 (1982), 1-14.
14. See, for example, Hans-Robert Jauss, *Towards an Aesthetic of Reception* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1985).

## **Chapter 5: The Discourses of Journalism: "Arnold and Pater" Again and Wilde, Laurel Brake**

1. T. S. Eliot, "Arnold and Pater," *Bookman*, 72 (1930), 1-7.
2. See Walter Pater, "Style," *Fortnightly Review*, 50 o.s. (1888), 730.

3. Frank Harris, "Walter Pater," *Contemporary Portraits*, 2nd series (New York: Frank Harris, 1919), 212.
4. See Linda Dowling, "Pater, Moore and the Fatal Book," *Prose Studies*, 7 (1984), 168-78. Dowling suggests additional antecedents for "Style," namely Newman's "Literature" in *The Idea of a University*, George Moore's *Confessions of a Young Man*, and Flaubert: it has long been noted that sections of Pater's review of Flaubert's correspondence (*Pall Mall Gazette*, 25 Aug. 1888) are embedded in "Style." Eliot's exclusion of Wilde has been challenged by Richard Ellmann in *The Artist as Critic* (London: W. H. Allen, 1969), and Regenia Gagnier in *Idylls of the Market-Place* (London: Scolar, 1987).
5. Oscar Wilde, "The Decay of Lying: A Dialogue," *Nineteenth Century*, 25 (1889), 35-56; "The True Function and Value of Criticism," *Nineteenth Century*, 28 (1890), 123-47, 435-59.
6. W. S. Landor, *Imaginary Conversations of Literary Men and Statesmen* (2nd ed; London: Henry Colburn, 1826).
7. Frederic Harrison, "Culture: a Dialogue," *Fortnightly Review*, 8 o.s. (1867), 603-14.
8. R. H. Super, "Vivacity and the Philistines," *Studies in English Literature* 6 (1966), 629-37.
9. Oscar Wilde, "Shakespeare and Stage Costume," *Nineteenth Century*, 17 (1885), 800-18.
10. Oscar Wilde, "Pen, Pencil, and Poison: A Study in Green," *Fortnightly Review*, 45 n.s. (1889), 41-54.
11. See Ann Parry, "The Intellectuals and the Middle Class Periodical Press: Theory, Method and Case Study," *Journal of Newspaper and Periodical History*, 4:3 (1989), 19, for a different estimate of *Macmillan's Magazine*.
12. [Anon. review], "Macmillan and Co.," *Bookman*, 1 (1891), 34.
13. "Prefatory Note," in Matthew Arnold, *Essays in Criticism. Second Series* (London: Macmillan, 1888).
14. Matthew Arnold, "Shelley," *Nineteenth Century*, 23, (1888), 23-39.

15. Matthew Arnold, "Count Leo Tolstoi," *Fortnightly Review*, 48 o.s. (1887), 783-99.
16. [Samuel H. Jeyes], "The Picture of Dorian Gray," *St James Gazette* (24 June 1890), 3-4.
17. Darrel Mansell, "Matthew Arnold's 'Study of Poetry' in its Original Context," *Modern Philology*, 83 (1986), 279-85.
18. *The Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold*, R. H. Super, ed. 11 vols. (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1960-77), III, 258.
19. Unpublished letter, T. H. Ward to Macmillan (24 Feb. 1879). Macmillan Archive, British Library.
20. Walter Pater, *Greek Studies* (London: Macmillan, 1895). See William Shuter, "Pater's Reshuffled Text," *Nineteenth Century Literature*, 43 (1989), 500-25, where it is shown (p. 504) that Pater used passages from "The Marbles of Aegina" in *Plato and Platonism* (1893).
21. [Anon. review], "M. Feuillet's *La Morte*," *Macmillan's Magazine*, 55 (1886), 97-105. On this review, see Gerald Monsman, *Walter Pater's Art of Autobiography* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1980), 27.
22. George Moore, *Literature at Nurse*, Pierre Coustillas, ed. (Hassocks, Sussex: Harvester, 1976); and "A New Censorship of Literature," *Pall Mall Gazette* (10 Dec. 1884), 1-2.
23. Moore, *Literature at Nurse*, 18.
24. Oscar Wilde, "The Soul of Man Under Socialism," *Fortnightly Review*, 55 o.s. (1891), 306.
25. Richard Burton, ed., *The Book of the Thousand Nights and a Night* (Benares: Kamashastra Society, 1885).
26. *Ibid.*, xvii.
27. [Walter Pater], "Ferdinand Fabre: An Idyll of the Cevennes," *Guardian* (12 June 1889), 911-12.
28. Walter Pater, "A Chapter on Plato," *Macmillan's Magazine*, 66 (1892), 31-38.

29. [Walter Pater], "Four Books for Students of English Literature," *Guardian* (17 Feb. 1886), 246-47; and Walter Pater "English at the Universities," *Pall Mall Gazette* (27 Nov. 1886), 1-2.
30. See *Letters of Walter Pater*, Lawrence Evans, ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), 106.
31. "Mr. Pater's Last Volume," *Speaker*, 1 (22 March 1890), 320.
32. Frank Harris, "Walter Pater," 215.
33. Frank Harris, *Oscar Wilde, His Life and Confessions*, 2 vols. (New York, Frank Harris, 1918). Harris claims that Pater refused his request out of awareness of personal danger, and finally wrote a review out of a sense of duty. While the *Fortnightly* continued to publish Wilde's most controversial work after *The Picture of Dorian Gray* appeared, it never published a review of the novel.
34. Walter Pater, "A Novel by Mr. Oscar Wilde," *Bookman*, 1 (1891), 59-60.
35. Matthew Arnold, "The Study of Poetry," *Essays in Criticism. Second Series*, 1.
36. Pater, "Style," 730.

## **Chapter 6: An Anxiety of No Influence: Walter Pater on William Wordsworth, J. P. Ward**

1. See Linda Dowling, *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986).
2. Michael Millgate, *Thomas Hardy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982), 273.
3. Walter Pater, *Appreciations* (London: Macmillan, 1889), 57.
4. Harriet Martineau, *Autobiography* (London: Virago, 1980), II, 239.
5. *Appreciations*, 85-87.
6. *Ibid.*, 221-22.
7. Walter Pater, *The Renaissance* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986), xxxi.

8. *Appreciations*, 40.

9. *Ibid.*, 49-50.

10. See F. W. Bateson, *Wordsworth: A Re-interpretation* (London: Longman, 1954), 38; Geoffrey Hartmann, *Wordsworth's Poetry* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1964), Part II; "An Interview with Louis Simpson," *The Wordsworth Circle*, 13, (1982).

11. *Appreciations*, 48.

12. Michael Levey, *The Case of Walter Pater* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1978), 153.

13. *Prelude*, 1805. XI, 328-29.

14. *Appreciations*, 51-52.

15. *Ibid.*, 52-58.

16. *Ibid.*, 52.

17. Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean*, Michael Levey, ed. (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1985), 122.

18. *Ibid.*, 38.

19. *Appreciations*, 3.

20. *Ibid.*, 7-12.

21. *Prelude* 1805. XI, 307-15.

## **Chapter 7:   Essaying "W. H. Pater Esq.": New Perspectives on the Tutor/Student Relationship Between Pater and Hopkins, Lesley Higgins**

1. Gerard Manley Hopkins, "To R. B.," in W. H. Gardner and N. H. MacKenzie, eds., *The Poems of Gerard Manley Hopkins*, 4th ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1967), 108. Hereafter *Poems*.

2. Claude Colleer Abbott, ed., *Further Letters of Gerard Manley Hopkins*, 2nd ed. (London: Oxford University Press, 1955), 255. Hereafter, *Further Letter*.
3. See especially David Downes, *Victorian Portraits: Hopkins and Pater* (New York: Bookman Associates, 1965); Gerald Monsman, *Walter Pater* (Boston: Twayne, 1977); and Alison Sulloway, *Gerard Manley Hopkins and the Victorian Temper* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1972).
4. Hopkins's well-known journal entry early in May 1866 begins "Coaching with W. H. Pater this term." See Humphry House and Graham Storey, eds., *The Journals and Papers of Gerard Manley Hopkins* (London: Oxford University Press, 1959), 133. Hereafter, *Journals and Papers*.
5. As Monsman and others have pointed out, it was Liddon who helped J. R. McQueen block Pater's plans for ordination in 1862. See Monsman, *Walter Pater*, 23-24; and Robert Seiler, ed., *Walter Pater: A Life Remembered* (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1987), 228-29, 233-35.
6. Liddon MS. Diary, 1864, entries for 8 and 10 February. The diaries are the property of Liddon House, St. Margaret's Church (Mayfair), London.
7. According to Edmund Gosse, Jowett was "so struck with [Pater's] power that he very generously offered to coach him for nothing" in 1860. (See *Critical Kit-Kats* [New York: Dodd, Mead and Co., 1896], 248). Monsman states that "during the 1861 Lent term" Pater "prepared a weekly essay" for Jowett (Monsman, *Walter Pater*, 24). Both sources repeat the story that Jowett once confided to Pater, "I think you have a mind that will come to great eminence." Pater's tribute to Jowett can be found in Lawrence Evans, ed., *Letters of Walter Pater* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1970), 267.
8. Samuel Brooke (1844-1898) was at Corpus Christi College from 1862 to 1866. Cleverness got Brooke elected to the Old Mortality Society in February 1863, approximately the same time as Pater joined; narrow-mindedness impelled him to quit the Society a year later and establish his own rival organization, the Hexameron Society. Brooke's diaries are housed in Corpus Christi, MS. CCC 498 (1-6). The quotations are cited from the entries for 20 and 29 Feb. 1864. See also Monsman, "Old Mortality at Oxford," *Studies in Philology*, 67 (1970), 359-89; and *Walter Pater*, 30-31. Pertinent excerpts from Brooke's diary are published in Seiler, *Walter Pater: A Life Remembered*, 11-13.
9. [Edmund Geldart] Nitram Tradleg, *A Son of Belial: Autobiographical Sketches* (London: Trubner and Co., 1882; reissued by University Microfilms International, 1976), 167-70.

10. *Journals and Papers*, 133.

11. *Journals and Papers*, 138.

12. Walter Pater, *Gaston de Latour* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 89. Unless otherwise indicated, all references to Pater's published work will be cited from the ten-volume Library Edition.

13. Brasenose brewed its own beer until 1886. Its lone literary distinction was that every Shrove Tuesday a new set of "Ale verses" was recited at the college's pancake supper party. In 1885, E. F. MacPherson penned an affectionate lampoon of Pater. See *Brasenose College Quatercentenary Monographs* (Oxford, 1909), II, 297.

14. John Buchan, "Nine Brasenose Worthies," *ibid.* II, 3-4.

15. Humphry Ward, "Brasenose, 1864-1872," *ibid.* II, 73. Charles Mallet lists Brasenose's distinctions as "pre-eminence in rowing, games, and sport." See Mallett, *A History of the University of Oxford*, vol. III, *Modern Oxford* (London: Methuen, 1927), 407.

16. *Further Letters*, 20.

17. A notebook now catalogued as MS. D.XII in the Champion Hall, Oxford Collection.

18. D.XII, f.1.

19. Walter Pater, *Plato and Platonism*, 175, 184.

20. A. C. Benson, *Walter Pater* (London: Macmillan, 1906), 25.

21. *Ibid.*

22. *Ibid.*

23. Jowett's lists of prospective essay topics are found among his papers in the Jowett Collection of Balliol College, Oxford.

24. Ward, "Brasenose, 1864-1872," 74.

25. D.III.6, f.18.

26. *Plato and Platonism*, 177.

27. D.III.1, f.1.

28. *Ibid.*, ff.1 and 4.

29. Pater, "Coleridge's Writings," *Westminster Review*, 85 (1866), 49.

30. "Coleridge's Writings," 53.

31. *Ibid.*, 57.

32. D.III.1, f.3 and f.4.

33. "Coleridge's Writings," 57.

34. Walter Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 51.

35. D.III.1, f.5.

36. D.III.4, f.14.

37. See especially Hopkins's essay "The Life of Socrates" (D.II.6), a paper of 1865 written for Jowett.

38. D.III.3, ff.12-13.

39. "Coleridge's Writings," 52.

40. D.III.3, f.10.

41. *Ibid.*

42. D.III.3, f.9

43. In several outlines for lectures written in the 1857-1865 period Jowett analyzes "Whether virtue or knowledge can be taught?" and whether "knowledge is virtue" (Jowett Collection, Box B). See also Hopkins's essay "The Life of Socrates" (D.II.6).

44. D.III.6, f.21.

45. *Plato and Platonism*, 187.
46. *Ibid.*, 193-94.
47. D.III.6, ff.21-22.
48. *Gaston de Latour*, 160.
49. D.VI.7.
50. For Pater's translation of *Symposium*, Steph. 210, see *Plato and Platonism*, 121-23.
51. D.III.4, f.15.
52. *Ibid.*
53. *Plato and Platonism*, 97.
54. D.XII.1, f.1.
55. *Ibid.*, f.2.
56. Billie A. Inman, *Walter Pater's Reading: A Bibliography of his Library Borrowings and Literary References, 1857-1873* (New York: Garland, 1981), 187.
57. Walter Pater, "Poems by William Morris," *Westminster Review*, n.s. 34 (1868), 149.
58. D.IX.3.
59. *Ibid.*, f.1.
60. Although "Winckelmann" appears in *The Renaissance*, I shall be quoting from the serial version of the essay that Hopkins would have read at that time. "Winckelmann," *Westminster Review*, 87 (1867), 36-50.
61. *Miscellaneous Studies*, 16.
62. "Winckelmann," 50. In his "Preface" to *The Renaissance*, Pater is much more

blunt, calling all metaphysical questions "unprofitable" p. x.

63. According to Lionel Tollemache, Jowett's response to a student "who had been reading him an essay with a strong metaphysical flavour" was: "It is remarkable what a fascination metaphysics seems to possess for the human mind. It is like falling in love. But you get over it after a time." See Lionel Tollemache, *Benjamin Jowett, Master of Balliol* (London: Edward Arnold, 1895), 72-73.

64. "Coleridge's Writings," 49.

65. *Ibid.*, 48.

66. D.IX.3, f.8.

67. *Ibid.*, ff.7-8.

68. *Ibid.*, ff.8-9.

69. *Ibid.*, f.9.

70. "Winckelmann," 45.

71. D.I.5.

72. D.I.6.

73. D.V.1.

74. Notes from an undated (1850s-1860s) black leather-covered notebook, inscribed inside the front cover, "1. True art colourless like water." (Jowett Collection, Balliol College, Box B). Another thick notebook containing "Lectures on Greek Literature Nov.1871" reveals that Jowett punctuated his discourse with references to classical inscriptions, monuments and statues, especially the "monuments to be found in the British Museum" (Jowett Collection, Balliol College, Box A, f.20).

75. Jowett Collection, Box B, ff.1-2.

76. D.III.1, f.1.

77. D.III.2, f.7.

78. George Grote, *Plato, and the Other Companions of Sokrates* (London: John Murray, 1865), III, 50.

79. *Marius the Epicurean*, II, 23.

80. *The Renaissance*, 141.

81. *Plato and Platonism*, 268.

82. D.III.5, f.17.

83. *Ibid.*, f.15v.

84. *Ibid.*, f.18.

85. "Coleridge's Writings," 54.

86. *Ibid.*, 55.

87. *Miscellaneous Studies*, 50-51.

88. *Renaissance*, 242-43.

89. Pater employs this unusual term to great advantage in his essay on "Coleridge's Writings." The "unity of aim" in Greek philosophy is the function of an "unfixed poetical prepossession" (54); morality is described as "a groundless prepossession until transformed into a religious recognition of a spiritual world" (56).

90. D.XII, ff.7-8.

91. *Marius the Epicurean*, II, 20.

## Chapter 8: Pater Speaking Bloom Speaking Joyce, F. C. McGrath

1. See my chapter on Pater's "Theory of Expression" in *The Sensible Spirit: Walter Pater and the Modernist Paradigm* (Tampa: University of South Florida Press, 1986), 184-214. For some other views of Pater's style, see Paul Barolsky, "From Mannerism to Modernism: The Playful Artifice of Walter Pater," *University of Hartford Studies in Literature*, 16: 2/3 (1984), 47-57; William E. Buckler, "The Poetics of Pater's Prose: 'The Child in the House'," *Victorian Poetry*, 23:3 (1985),

281-88; Edmund Chandler, "Pater on Style," *Anglistica*, 11 (1958), 1-100 (Copenhagen: Rosenkilde and Bagger, 1958); Zilpha E. Chandler, "An Analysis of the Stylistic Techniques of Addison, Johnson, Hazlitt, and Pater," *University of Iowa Humanistic Studies*, 4 (1928), 75-89; David J. DeLaura, "Some Victorian Experiments in Closure," *Studies in the Literary Imagination*, 8 (1975), 19-35, and "Newman and the Cult of Style," *The Victorian Newsletter*, 51 (1977), 6-10; Linda Dowling, "Pater, Moore and the Fatal Book," *Prose Studies*, 7:2 (1984), 168-78, and *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987); John J. Duffy, "Walter Pater's Prose Style: An Essay in Theory and Analysis," *Style*, 1 (1967), 45-63; Stanley Fish, *Is There a Text in This Class?* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1980), 30-35; G. S. Fraser, "Walter Pater: His Theory of Style, His Style in Practice, His Influence," *The Art of Victorian Prose*, George Levine and William Madden, eds. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1968); Billie A. Inman "Pater's Appeal to His Readers: A Study of Two of Pater's Prose Styles," *Texas Studies in Literature and Language*, 14 (1973), 643-66; Wolfgang Iser, *Walter Pater: The Aesthetic Moment*, David Henry Wilson, trans. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987); Lionel Johnson, "The Work of Mr. Pater," *Fortnightly Review*, ns. 56 (1894), 352-67; John R. Reed, "Decadent Style," *North American Review*, 266:4 (1981), 59-61; Ian Small, "Computational Stylistics and the Construction of Literary Readings: Work in Progress," *Prose Studies*, 7:3 (1984), 250-60; Julia Whitsitt, "The Vision Within: Pater's Style and Radical Individualism," *New Orleans Review*, 8:2 (1981), 173-76.

2. Walter Pater, *Appreciations* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 8.

3. For Pater's anticipation of contemporary thought on language, see Harold Bloom, "Introduction" to *Selected Writings of Walter Pater* (New York: New American Library, 1974), vii-xxxi; Dowling, *Language and Decadence*; J. Hillis Miller, "Walter Pater: A Partial Portrait," *Daedalus*, 105:1 (1976), 97-113; Gerald Monsman, "Pater Redivivus," *The Victorian Experience: The Prose Writers*, Richard A. Levine, ed. (Athens: Ohio University Press, 1982), 203-39, and *Walter Pater's Art of Autobiography* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1980); and Nathan A. Scott, Jr., "Pater's Imperative To Dwell Poetically," *New Literary History: A Journal of Theory and Interpretation*, 15:1 (1983), 93-118.

4. Ian Fletcher, "Walter Pater," in *Walter Pater: Modern Critical Views*, Harold Bloom, ed. (New York: Chelsea House, 1985), 68.

5. Walter Pater, *Plato and Platonism* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 190.

6. A. Walton Litz, *The Art of James Joyce* (London: Oxford University Press, 1964), 34; and J. S. Atherton, "The Oxen of the Sun," *James Joyce's Ulysses: Critical Essays*, Clive Hart and David Hayman, eds. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1974), 315.

7. Anthony Burgess, *Here Comes Everybody: An Introduction to Joyce for the Ordinary Reader* (London: Faber and Faber, 1965), 156.
8. Atherton, "The Oxen of the Sun," 313-16.
9. Karen Lawrence, *The Odyssey of Style in Ulysses* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981), 144.
10. Ibid. 145; and Michael Groden, *Ulysses in Progress* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1977), 50.
11. Wolfgang Iser, *The Implied Reader: Patterns of Communication in Prose Fiction from Bunyan to Beckett* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1974), 192, 202.
12. Harry Blamires, *The Bloomsday Book: A Guide through Joyce's Ulysses* (London: Methuen, 1966), 162.
13. Colin MacCabe, *James Joyce and the Revolution of the Word* (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1979), 126.
14. Fredric Jameson, *Nationalism, Colonialism and Literature: Modernism and Imperialism*. Field Day Pamphlet 14 (Derry: Field Day Theatre Company, 1988), 21.
15. The most thorough exploration of the Modernist, multiple perspectives approach to "Oxen of the Sun" and to *Ulysses* in general is Iser, *The Implied Reader*, 179-233.
16. These drawings are reproduced in Richard Ellmann, *James Joyce* (rev. ed.; New York: Oxford University Press, 1982), plates XXXIX and LI, following 482.
17. James Joyce, *Ulysses* (New York: Random House, 1986), 344.
18. Since most of the Pater passages Joyce copied into his notebook are not memorable, I have listed them below for anyone who desires to pursue Joyce's use of Pater further. Joyce's transcriptions contain inaccuracies and he did not identify the passages except to list some under the heading of "Marius the Epicurean" and some under the heading of "Imaginary Portraits." All those he listed as being from *Marius* are from volume one. Of those he listed under "Imaginary Portraits," eleven are from *Imaginary Portraits* and the last four are from volume two of *Marius*. The order below is the order in which they appear in Joyce's notebook (*James Joyce: Notes, Criticism, Translations, & Miscellaneous Writings*, Hans

Walter Gabler, ed., 2 vols. [New York: Garland, 1979], II, 384-89). Long passages are listed by their opening and closing phrases.

They comprehended a multitude . . . in which were those well-remembered roses. (*Marius the Epicurean* [London: Macmillan, 1910], I, 106-07).

Down the dewy paths the people were descending . . . like a wild picture drawn from Virgil. (*Marius*, I, 161-62).

The temple of Antoninus and Faustina was still fresh . . . though the birds had built freely among them. (*Marius*, I, 173).

Marius could distinguish, could distinguish clearly, the well known profile, between the floating purple curtains. (*Marius*, I, 177).

The nostrils and mouth seemed capable almost of peevishness . . . the flesh had scarcely been an equal gainer with the spirit. (*Marius*, I, 191).

The discourse ended almost in darkness . . . and at no time had the winter roses from Carthage seemed more lustrously yellow and red. (*Marius*, I, 211).

It might be almost edifying . . . as neatly as if it were a stocking . . . (*Marius*, I, 239). [At the beginning of this quotation Joyce wrote in parentheses "Marsyas."]

And meantime those dreams of remote and probably adventurous travel . . . in the foldings of the hillside. ("Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits*, 134).

. . . a marvellous tact of omission . . . ("A Prince of Court Painters," *Imaginary Portraits*, 6). [After this quotation Joyce wrote in parentheses "Watteau."]

Methinks I see him there . . . over which the sun is sinking. ("A Prince of Court Painters," *Imaginary Portraits*, 10).

. . . "The evening will be a wet one." . . . and the secular trees themselves will hardly outlast another generation. ("A Prince of Court Painters," *Imaginary Portraits*, 32).

He was always a seeker after something in the world that is there in no satisfying measure, or not at all. ("A Prince of Court Painters," *Imaginary Portraits*, 44).

The pavement of the choir . . . in a sudden oblique ray of ghastly dawn. ("Denys L'Auxerrois," *Imaginary Portraits*, 69).

. . . a flask of lively green glass . . . ("Denys L'Auxerrois," *Imaginary Portraits*, 56).

. . . the riotous and earthy heat of [old] paganism [itself] . . . ("Denys L'Auxerrois," *Imaginary Portraits*, 56). [Joyce omitted the words in brackets.]

Tears rose in the eyes of needy children . . . after scattered hedge-nuts or dried vine-tendrils. ("Denys L'Auxerrois," *Imaginary Portraits*, 67).

From a comfortless portico . . . the like of which one was used to hear. ("Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits*, 127).

. . . the young Duke had often peered at the faded glories of the immense coroneted coffins, the oldest shedding their velvet tatters around them. ("Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits*, 138).

. . . his goodwill sunned her wild-grown beauty into majesty . . . in the wood-sides and on the hilltops. ("Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits*, 148-49).

The air there . . . in its slow, wise, maturing work. (*Marius*, II, 65-66). [This passage was cited by George Saintsbury, *A History of English Prose Rhythm* (1912; Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1965), 425-26.]

Lastly, herb and tree had taken possession . . . against the wide realms of sunset. (*Marius*, II, 96).

Men and women came to the altar successively . . . with an increasing mysticity and effusion the rite proceeded. (*Marius*, II, 137).

Among the captives . . . in his misshapen features, and the pale,

servile, yet angry eyes. (*Marius*, II, 197).

19. Walter Pater, *Marius*, I, 191; *James Joyce: Notes, Criticism, Translations*, II, 385.

20. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 127; *James Joyce: Notes, Criticism, Translations*, II, 387-88.

21. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 32; *James Joyce: Notes, Criticism, Translations*, II, 387.

22. Lionel Johnson, "The Work of Mr. Pater," 356-57; and George Saintsbury, *A History of English Prose Rhythm*, 420-21.

23. Roland Barthes, *Mythologies* (London: Granada, 1972), 127.

24. Walter Pater, *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 136.

25. Walter Pater, "Poems by William Morris," *Westminster Review*, 90 (1868), 300.

26. *Ibid.*, 305.

27. *Ibid.*, 301.

28. *Ibid.*, 302.

29. Joyce, *Ulysses*, 344.

30. *Ibid.*, 320.

31. Robert Janusko, *The Sources and Structures of James Joyce's "Oxen"* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1983), 64, 95, 103.

32. Joyce, *Ulysses*, 94-95.

33. *Ibid.*, 344.

34. A. Walton Litz, *The Art of James Joyce*, 36.

35. Richard Ellmann, Introduction to *My Brother's Keeper* by Stanislaus Joyce

(New York: Viking, 1958), xix.

36. Oscar Wilde, *The Artist As Critic: Critical Writings of Oscar Wilde*, Richard Ellmann, ed. (New York: Random House, 1968), 305, 316.

## Chapter 9: Pater as a "Moralist", Paul Tucker

1. See David DeLaura, *Hebrew and Hellene in Victorian England: Newman, Arnold, and Pater* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1969), 179. Cf. T. S. Eliot, "Arnold and Pater" in *Selected Essays*. (3rd ed. London: Faber, 1951), 439; Frank Kermode, *The Romantic Image* (1957; Glasgow: Collins, 1976), 33; and Ian Fletcher, *Walter Pater* (1959; Harlow: Longmans, 1971), 15.

2. "He began as an aesthete, and ended as a moralist. By faithful and self-restraining cultivation of the sense of harmony, he appears to have risen from the perception of visible beauty to the knowledge of beauty of the spiritual kind, both being expressions of the same perfect fittingness to an ever more intense and various and congruous life"; repr. in Robert Seiler, ed. *Walter Pater: The Critical Heritage* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1980), 294. Cf. Ruth Child's comment: "He began his work with an emphasis on art for art's sake, but progressed gradually to a greater and greater emphasis on the ethical function of art." (*The Aesthetic of Walter Pater* [1940; New York: Octagon, 1969], 10.)

3. See, for example, Kermode, *The Romantic Image*, 33; Richard L. Stein, *The Ritual of Interpretation* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1975), 261; and Hilary Fraser, *Beauty and Belief: Aesthetics and Religion in Victorian Literature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 198.

4. See Seiler, *The Critical Heritage*, 297.

5. An exception appears to be Wohlee Choe. See "Walter Pater's 'Romantic Morality'," *Victorian Newsletter*, 72 (1987), 12-17.

6. Stein, *The Ritual of Interpretation*, 261-62.

7. Fraser, *Beauty and Belief*, 198.

8. *Ibid.*

9. *Ibid.*, 199-200.

10. *Ibid.*

11. Ibid., 201.
12. Walter Pater, "Coleridge's Writings" (1866); repr. in *English Critical Essays: Nineteenth Century*, Edmund D. Jones, ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1971), 22.
13. Pater, *Studies in the History of the Renaissance*, (1873; London: Macmillan, 1910), 55-56.
14. Pater, "Coleridge's Writings," 456.
15. Ibid.
16. Walter Pater, *Appreciations* (1889; London: Macmillan, 1910), 183.
17. Auguste Comte, *Système de politique positive ou Traité de sociologie instituant la Religion de l'Humanité*, 4 vols. (Paris, 1851-1854), IV, 282.
18. Antimo Negri, *Augusto Comte* (Rome: Armando, 1971), 301.
19. David Hume, *A Treatise of Human Nature* (1739-1740; Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1987), 632.
20. Ibid., 630.
21. "Sympathy, appreciation, a sense of latent claims in things which even ordinary good men pass rudely by these on the whole are the characteristic traits of its artists [the artists of the Renaissance], though it may still be true that 'aesthetic propriety, rather than strict conceptions of duty, ruled the conduct even of the best'; and at least they never 'destroyed pity in their souls' " (Pater, review [1875] of *The Renaissance in Italy: The Age of the Despots*, by J. A. Symonds; repr. in *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry: The 1893 Text*, Donald Hill, ed. [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980], 199).
22. "And, working ever close to the concrete, to the details, great or small, of actual things, books, persons, and with no part of them blurred to his vision by the intervention of mere abstract theories, he has reached an enduring moral effect also, in a sort of boundless sympathy" (Pater, *Appreciations*, 109).
23. Pater, *Appreciations*, 184.
24. T. R. Wright, *The Religion of Humanity: The Impact of Comtean Positivism on*

*Victorian Britain* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 199.

25. M. H. Abrams, *The Mirror and the Lamp: Romantic Theory and the Romantic Tradition* (1953; London: Oxford University Press, 1977), 332.

26. Pater, *Appreciations*, 184.

27. Walter Pater, "Poems by William Morris," *Westminster Review*, n.s. 34 (October, 1868), 312.

28. Alasdair MacIntyre, *A Short History of Ethics* (New York: Macmillan, 1966), 84.

29. Pater, "Poems by William Morris," 312.

30. *Ibid.*, 311.

31. See Billie Andrew Inman, *Walter Pater's Reading: A Bibliography of His Library Borrowings and Literary References, 1858-1873* (New York: Garland, 1981), 14-19, 58-60, 68-72. For the "higher morality," see particularly 59.

32. Remo Bodei, *Scomposizioni: forme dell'individuo moderno* (Turin: Einaudi, 1987), 127.

33. Radoslav A. Tsanoff, "Fichte, Johann Gottlieb," *The Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (1967), 195.

34. *Einige Vorlesungen über die Bestimmung des Gelehrten* [*On the Mission of the Scholar*] (1794); *Über das Wesen des Gelehrten* [*On the Essence of the Scholar*] (1805); *Fünfe Vorlesungen über die Bestimmung des Gelehrten* (1811).

35. J. G. Fichte. *Werke*, I. H. Fichte, ed. (1845-46; Berlin: de Gruyter, 1971), VI, 331.

36. See Gerald Monsman, "Old Mortality at Oxford," *Studies in Philology*, 67 (July 1970), 359-89; "Pater, Hopkins and Fichte's Ideal Student," *South Atlantic Quarterly*, 70 (1971), 367-70; and *Walter Pater* (London: Twayne, 1977), especially 31.

37. "The true and immediate mode of being in the divine idea requires of us that we become, and therefore that we deplore our being's standing still at any given moment" (Fichte, *Werke*, VI, 387); "The following rule is good for all men, and even more for the scholar. Let him forget what he has done as soon as he has done

it, and let him think only of what he still has to do" (Fichte, *Werke*, VI, 329). (All translations from Fichte are my own.)

38. Pater, "Coleridge's Writings," 448.

39. Ibid.

40. Fichte, *Werke*, V, 469.

41. "To suppose that what is called 'ontology' is what the speculative spirit seeks, is the misconception of a backward school of logicians. Who would change the colour or curve of a roseleaf for that *ousia achromatos, asahematistos, anaphes* ("colourless, formless, intangible essence" [transcribed from Greek in original]). A transcendentalism that makes what is abstract more excellent than what is concrete has nothing akin to the leading philosophies of the world. The true illustration of the speculative temper is not the Hindoo, lost to sense, understanding, individuality; but such an one as Goethe, to whom every moment of life brought its share of experimental, individual knowledge, by whom no touch of the world of form, colour, and passion was disregarded" ("Coleridge's Writings," 423). As a measure of the distance between Pater and Fichte with regard to the ontological status of the self, it is to be noted that in *Die Anweisung zum seligen Leben* Fichte adopts precisely the Platonic terminology (*Phaedrus*, 247 C) that Pater rejects above to express the self's divine parentage, notwithstanding its otherwise finite condition: "What you see is eternally you yourself; but you are not it as you see it, nor do you see it as you are it. You are it in so far as you are unchanging, pure, without form or colour. Only this reflection, which is you yourself, and from which you therefore can never separate yourself; only the reflection breaks it up into infinite rays and forms" (Fichte, *Werke*, V, 458).

42. Pater, "Poems by William Morris," 312.

43. Ibid., 311.

44. But through its association with art the morality of "sympathy" itself acquires a broader, theoretical significance. For art may be seen as a model not only of judgment but also of representation.

45. Pater, "Coleridge's Writings," 423.

46. Pater, "Poems by William Morris," 311.

47. The confluence of ethical and theoretical motives in Pater's ethic of "passion" may be illustrated by a further comparison with classical ethics, especially with the ethical systems of the Hellenistic philosophies, with their private outlook and

defensive, consolatory stance. If "[p]hilosophy, as many have said, responded to the unsettled age of the Hellenistic monarchs by turning away from disinterested speculation to the provision of security for the individual" (A. A. Long, *Hellenistic Philosophy: Stoics, Epicureans, Sceptics* [2nd ed. London: Duckworth, 1986], 3), Pater's ethic of "passion" answers a similar need, although the state of insecurity it moves from is not of a political but of a theoretical order: modern philosophy and natural science had seemingly undermined the very fabric of experience. The theoretical concerns of the "Conclusion" explain why one might, practically speaking, think it "almost anticlimactic" (Stein, *The Ritual of Interpretation*, 256).

48. DeLaura says that Pater "uses a swarm of words suggesting refined, passive, sensuous, largely visual experience observation, mood, insight, variegated, dramatic, see, senses, eye, lifted horizon, strange dyes and flowers, curious odors, art works, the face of one's friend, discriminate, splendor of experience, see and touch, curiously test new opinions, new impressions, regard which beget a second swarm of terms suggesting intense momentary thrills, frissons: delicious recoil, race, drift, flight, tremulous, dissolution, pulsations, rouse, startle, ecstasy, exquisite passion, excitement, irresistibly real and attractive, the focus of 'vital forces', melts, grasp, stirring, desperate effort, 'courting' impressions" (DeLaura, *Hebrew and Hellene*, 226). It seems to me that DeLaura's characterization of the kind of experience named by his first group as "passive" has to some extent confused the two sets of terms, and that as a result certain words have been misplaced. Moreover, although his aim is to give a picture of the "Paterian ideal" through Pater's key-words, he has indiscriminately included terms from the earlier, expository paragraphs of the "Conclusion," whose referent is not the subject addressed or described in the final paragraphs.

49. Unlike German, English does not have two words to express these two different conceptions of experience. For an account of the separation of the concept of "Erlebnis" (an) immediately lived experience from that of "Erfahrung" the having experience of something in the second half of the nineteenth century, see Hans-Georg Gadamer, *Truth and Method* (2nd ed. London: Sheed and Ward, 1979), 55-63; and Leonardo Amoroso, *L'estetica come problema* (Pisa: ETS, 1988).

50. Pater, "Coleridge's Writings," 423.

51. From the Greek for "things perceptible by the senses."

52. Pater, "Coleridge's Writings," 422-23.

53. *Ibid.*, 423.

54. As perhaps all scepticism does. Cf. Merleau-Ponty: "Le scepticisme a deux

faces. Il signifie que rien n'est vrai, mais aussi que rien n'est faux." *Eloge de la philosophie* (1953; rpt. Paris: Gallimard, 1963, 321.)

55. See David DeLaura, *Hebrew and Hellene*, 224; and Gerald Monsman, *Walter Pater*, 57.

56. Pater, "Poems by William Morris," 309.

57. *Ibid.*, 305.

58. *Ibid.*

59. *Ibid.*, 303.

60. *Ibid.*, 312.

61. Adrian Stokes, *The Critical Writings*, 3 vols. (London: Thames & Hudson, 1978), III, 339.

62. G. W. F. Hegel, *Introduction to Aesthetics: Being the Introduction to the Berlin Aesthetics Lectures of the 1820s*, T. M. Knox, trans. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1979), 7.

63. *Ibid.*, 7-8.

64. Cf. Richard Wollheim, who unjustifiably limits Pater's interest in Hegel's schematic distinction between Form and Content to one "registered predominantly on a more psychological level." (Wollheim, "Walter Pater as a Critic of the Arts," in *On Art and the Mind* [London: Allen Lane, 1973], 171-72.)

65. Pater, *The Renaissance*, 206.

66. *Ibid.*, 230.

67. Cf. Wolfgang Iser, who makes a similar point about Pater's criticism of Renaissance painting, but robs it of positive theoretic point by subordinating it to the pure indeterminacy of what he calls "mood": "Art, then, is an in-between region of undecidedness, separating itself from a single metaphysical interpretation of the world without being committed to rejecting such an interpretation. . . . Mood has replaced metaphysical hierarchies, and for Pater it is mood that determines art. . . . Art removes the intentionality of a challenging reality, and replaces it with a transitional reality that neither rejects the old nor the new, but remains a mood in which contrasts lose their firm outlines and begin to

merge" (Wolfgang Iser, *Walter Pater: The Aesthetic Moment*, D. H. Wilson, trans. [Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987], 40).

68. Pater, *The Renaissance*, 125.

69. *Ibid.*, 231.

70. Pater, "Poems by William Morris," 311.

71. Pater, *The Renaissance*, 48.

72. *Ibid.*, 56.

73. Cf. Iser: "The inherent contradictions impair the symbolic qualities of the paintings [of the Madonna and of Venus]. Yet this seems to have been done deliberately; the gradual effacing of the symbolic significance gives expression to an emerging mood" (*Walter Pater: The Aesthetic Moment*, 41).

## Chapter 10: Critical Impressionism as Anti Phallogocentric Strategy, *Richard Dellamora*

1. See Ian Small, "Introduction," in Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean: His Sensations and Ideas* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986), vii-xxii.

2. W. David Shaw, *The Lucid Veil: Poetic Truth in the Victorian Age* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), 168.

3. Cited by Shaw, 168.

4. See Linda Dowling, *Language and Decadence in the Victorian Fin de Siècle* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986); Robert Crawford, "Pater's *Renaissance*, Andrew Lang, and Anthropological Romanticism," *ELH*, 53 (1986), 849-79; and Morse Peckham, *Victorian Revolutionaries: Speculations on Some Heroes of a Culture Crisis* (New York: Braziller, 1970), ch. 5.

5. Walter Pater, *Appreciations with an Essay on Style* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 68-69, 66.

6. *Ibid.*, 104. [Love is the] father of delicacy, of splendour, of luxury, of the Graces, of desire, and of longing.

7. Ibid., 103-104.
8. Walter Pater, *Studies in the History of the Renaissance* (London: Macmillan, 1873), viii.
9. Pater, *Letters*, Lawrence Evans, ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), 13.
10. Quoted in Jeffrey Wallen, "On Pater's Use and Abuse of Quotation," *Arnoldian*, 14 (Winter 1986), 1.
11. See Wayne Koestenbaum's discussion of *The Waste Land* in *Double Talk: The Erotics of Male Literary Collaboration* (New York: Routledge, 1989), ch. 4.
12. J. Hillis Miller, "Walter Pater: A Partial Portrait," *Daedalus*, 105 (1976), 98.
13. Ibid., 106.
14. Ibid., 108.
15. See my discussion of the passage in *Masculine Desire: The Sexual Politics of Victorian Aestheticism* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1990), 139-40.
16. Miller, 99.
17. Quoted by Miller, 102.
18. Ibid., 106.
19. Ibid., 112.
20. See Monique Wittig, "The Straight Mind," *Feminist Issues*, 1 (1980), 103-11.
21. Walter Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 143, 144, 143-44, 164. In Miller's/Freud's terms, the murder of Hyacinth might be seen as the psychological destruction of desire, fixed at an "adolescent homosexual stage," in the Prior.
22. Crawford, 867.
23. See Richard M. Dorson, "The Eclipse of Solar Mythology," *Myth: A Symposium*, Thomas A. Sebeok, ed. (Philadelphia: American Folklore Society,

1955).

24. Quoted in Crawford, "Pater's *Renaissance*, Andrew Lang, and Anthropological Romanticism," 865.

25. *Ibid.*, 859.

26. See Robert Peters, "The Cult of the Returned Apollo: Walter Pater's *Renaissance* and *Imaginary Portraits*," *PRR*, 2 (1981), 53-69.

27. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 188.

28. Miller, 108.

29. *Ibid.*, 109.

30. *Ibid.*

31. Walter Pater, *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry: The 1893 Text*, Donald L. Hill, ed. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980), 165.

32. Wallen, "On Pater's Use and Abuse of Quotation," 15.

33. See *Ibid.*, 17.

34. See Peter Clarke, *Liberals and Social Democrats* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978).

35. See Patrick Brantlinger, *Rule of Darkness: British Literature and Imperialism, 1830-1914* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1988), 202.

36. Matthew Arnold, *Complete Prose Works*, R. H. Super, ed., 11 vols. (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1960), III, 145-46.

37. John Lee, Tim Garrigan, and Bob Connell, "Toward a New Sociology of Masculinity," *Theory and Society*, 14 (1985), 587.

38. I adapt the phrase, "homosexual existence," from Adrienne Rich, "Compulsory Heterosexuality and Lesbian Existence," *Signs*, 5 (1980), 631-60.

39. Sharon Bassett, "Marius and the Varieties of Stoic Will: `Can the Will Itself Be an Organ of Knowledge, of Vision?'" *ELT*, 7 (1984), 57.

40. Arnold, *Complete Prose Works*, III, 149.
41. Daniel T. O'Hara, *The Romance of Interpretation: Visionary Criticism from Pater to de Man* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1985), 16.
42. Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean: His Sensations and Ideas*, 2 vols. (London: Macmillan, 1910), II, 66.
43. *Ibid.*, II, 68.
44. *Ibid.*, II, 72.
45. *Ibid.*, II, 70.
46. O'Hara, *The Romance of Interpretation*, 41; emphasis added.
47. Pater, *Marius*, II, 115.
48. The final phrase is from the second edition of 1885, II, 110.
49. Walter Pater, *Studies in the History of the Renaissance*, 92; and *Imaginary Portraits* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 52-53.
50. Pater, *The Renaissance*, Hill, ed., 106.
51. *Ibid.*, 105.
52. Miller, 101.
53. In the present context, by revisionary masculine discourses I mean discourses which attempt to enlarge masculine capacities for relationship while remaining principally concerned with male-female relations. See Percy Bysshe Shelley, *Complete Works*, 10 vols; Roger Ingpen and Walter E. Peck, eds. (London: Benn, 1965), VI, 325; and, as I indicate below, Pater's "Denys l'Auxerrois."
54. See Robert K. Martin, *Hero, Captain, and Stranger: Male Friendship, Social Critique, and Literary Form in the Sea Novels of Herman Melville* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1986), ch. 2.
55. *Ibid.*, 54.

56. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 54.

57. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 156, 164.

58. Miller, 112.

59. Nancy K. Miller, *Subject to Change: Reading Feminist Writing* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988), 91.

60. *Ibid.*, 100 fn. 21.

61. Miller, "Ariadne's Thread: Repetition and the Narrative Line," in *Interpretation of Narrative*, Mario J. Valdes and Owen J. Miller, eds. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1978), 159.

62. *Ibid.*, 164.

63. See Joseph Allen Boone, "Mappings of Male Desire in Durrell's *Alexandria Quartet*," *South Atlantic Quarterly*, 88 (1989), 73-106; and Lee Edelman, "Homographesis," *Yale Journal of Criticism*, 3 (1989), 189-207.

## Chapter 11: "The Last Thing Water Wrote": Pater's "Pascal", *Hayden Ward*

1. Michael Levey, *The Case of Walter Pater* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1978), 230.

2. Walter Pater, *Letters of Walter Pater*, Lawrence Evans, ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), 156-57.

3. Clara Pater's letter of transmittal to Gosse, dated 13 November 1895, prefaces the bound manuscript, in the Bodleian Library (Ms. Don d. 84).

4. Among the writers who discuss "Pascal" in relation to Pater's own religious position are Germain D'Hangest, *Walter Pater: l'homme et l'oeuvre*, 2 vols. (Paris: Didier, 1961), 2: 251-52; David J. DeLaura, *Hebrew and Hellene in Victorian England* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1969), 338ff.; and John J. Conlon, *Walter Pater and the French Tradition* (Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 1982), 160-63.

5. Conlon, 155-56.

6. Walter Pater, *Appreciations* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 137-38.

7. Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean*, 2 vols. (London: Macmillan, 1910), 1, 150. In the notes to his edition of *Marius* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1985), 306, Michael Levey identifies the quotation as from the ante-penultimate paragraph of Pascal's *Entretiens avec M. de Saci sur Epictete et Montaigne* (1655) and notes that Pater repeats the point in the Pascal essay (*Miscellaneous Studies* [London: Macmillan, 1910], 85).

8. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 69.

9. *Ibid.*, 80.

10. *Ibid.*, 63.

11. *Ibid.*, 67.

12. Blaise Pascal, *The Provincial Letters*, Alban Kraitsheimer, trans. (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1967), 167. Pater quotes part of this passage in Pascal's French original: "C'est proprement à la vérité qu'il appartient de rire parce qu'elle est gaie, et de se jouer de ses ennemis parce qu'elle est assurée de sa victoire" (*Miscellaneous Studies*, 72). Kraitsheimer has also translated the *Pensées* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1966).

13. *Miscellaneous Studies*, 68.

14. Although Pater does not say so explicitly, the process he describes Pascal as undergoing, as his commitment to Jansenism deepens, is analogous to the process of Newman's gradual turning away from the ahistorical Anglican Church to the truly "developed" Roman Church. The apparently casual reference to Newman's *Apologia* that Pater makes in defining the tone of *The Provincial Letters* has implications throughout the entire essay on Pascal.

15. *Ibid.*, 70.

16. *Ibid.*, 77. Somewhat overstating the case, Germain D'Hangest concludes his analysis of the Pascal essay by applying the term *agonia* to the tension, in Pater himself, of residual skepticism and the will to believe (D'Hangest, 2: 252).

17. Hugh Davidson writes of *Port-Royal* (1840) that Sainte-Beuve "evokes [an] image of Pascal, that of the reader of Montaigne and the man of the world who brought into a theological debate new notes of humor, playfulness, and a certain fashionable indifference," in *Blaise Pascal* (Boston: Twayne, 1983), 114-15. These are the qualities that Pater, too, emphasizes in discussing *The Provincial*

*Letters.*

18. Richard M. Chadbourne, *Charles Augustin Sainte-Beuve* (Boston: Twayne, 1977), 114-15.
19. Alban Krailsheimer, *Pascal* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980), 51. I am much indebted to Krailsheimer's analysis of Pascal's argument vis-à-vis Montaigne, especially pages 50-59.
20. *Ibid.*, 53.
21. Walter Pater, *Gaston de Latour* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 93.
22. Walter Pater, *Plato and Platonism* (London: Macmillan, 1910). See especially the chapter called "The Genius of Plato" for instance, 125-26.
23. Walter Pater, *Essays from "The Guardian"* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 67-68.
24. For a useful, brief discussion of Pascal's "Augustinian" views in relation both to Pater and to Leslie Stephen, see Noel Annan, *Leslie Stephen: The Godless Victorian*, rev. ed. (New York: Random House, 1984), 263-64.
25. Leslie Stephen, *Studies of a Biographer*, 4 vols. (London: Duckworth, 1898-1902), 2, 241-84.
26. In the introduction to his translation of the *Pensées* (21), Krailsheimer disputes the accuracy of calling the Jansenists "Calvinists" of the Roman Catholic Church; moreover, he says that Pascal cannot be called a "Jansenist" except by way of loose affiliation. However, that Pater believed him a kind of Calvinist is explicit in his essay.
27. See Davidson, 85: "One may safely say, I think, that every important term in the *Pensées* is involved in some kind of semantic paradox." Davidson's comments on Pascal's "nongeometrical way of defining words" help to explain what Pater regards as a puzzling, and disabling, contradiction.
28. Matthew Arnold, *Lectures and Essays in Criticism*, vol. 3 of *Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold*, R. H. Super, ed. (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1962), 230.
29. "The Writings of Cardinal Newman," Houghton Ms. bMsEng1150 (12). Although it is undated, the essay may be from the early 1880s, when Pater was planning *Marius the Epicurean*, a work much indebted to Newman's *Grammar of*

*Assent* (as DeLaura explains in *Hebrew and Hellene*, 314-26), which was originally published in 1870 and appeared in a new edition in 1881. *The Grammar* is a recurring focal point in Pater's discontinuous manuscript pages. As its title indicates, Pater's manuscript cannot date from before 1879.

30. As DeLaura notes (308), Pater's passing allusion to Newman in the essay on Winckelmann (*The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry: The 1893 Text*, Donald L. Hill, ed. [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980], 159) defines Newman as a champion of the idea of "culture." The view is much the same in the incomplete, unpublished essay of several years later. Needless to say, DeLaura, a distinguished Catholic scholar, finds Pater's understanding of Newman inadequate, because it is much too selective.

## **Chapter 12: The Historiography of *Studies in the History of the Renaissance*, J. B. Bullen**

1. Claude Lévi-Strauss, *The Raw and the Cooked*, John and Doreen Weightman, trans. (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1986), 13.
2. Walter Pater, *Appreciations* (1889; London: Macmillan, 1900), 5-6.
3. Roland Barthes, *The Rustle of Language*, Richard Howard, trans. (Oxford: Blackwell, 1986), 138.
4. *Ibid.*, 137-38.
5. *Ibid.*, 137.
6. Gerald Monsman, *Walter Pater's Art of Autobiography* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1980), 13.
7. Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean* (1885; London: Macmillan, 1914), I, 117.
8. In the second edition of 1877 it became *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry*.
9. Stephen Bann, *The Clothing of Clio* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), 36.
10. Walter Pater, *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry*, Donald Hill, ed. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980), 44.

11. Ibid., 45.
12. Ibid., 44.
13. Walter Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies* (London: Macmillan, 1895), 257.
14. Walter Pater, "Coleridge's Writings," *Westminster Review*, 29 n.s. (1866), 114.
15. Walter Pater, "Winckelmann," *Westminster Review*, n.s. 31 (1867), 83. My emphasis.
16. Walter Pater, "Poems by William Morris," *Westminster Review*, n.s. 34 (1868), 307. My emphasis.
17. "Poems by William Morris," 302-303.
18. Ibid., 308.
19. Ibid., 305.
20. Pater, "Winckelmann," 94-95.
21. J. B. Bullen, "Walter Pater's Interpretation of the Mona Lisa as a Symbol of Romanticism," *The Romantic Heritage*, ed. Karsten Engelberg (Copenhagen: Publications of the Department of English, University of Copenhagen, 1983), 139-52.
22. Pater, *The Renaissance*, 97.
23. A. C. Swinburne, "Notes on Designs of the Old Masters at Florence," *Fortnightly Review*, n.s. 4 (1868), 17.
24. Ibid., 16.
25. Pater, *The Renaissance*, 45.
26. Monsman, *Walter Pater's Art of Autobiography*, 24.
27. Pater, *The Renaissance*, 98.
28. Monsman, *Walter Pater's Art of Autobiography*, 24.

29. Pater, *The Renaissance*, 184.

30. Théophile Gautier, "Leonardo Da Vinci," in *Les Dieux et les demidieux de la peinture*, par Théophile Gautier, A. Houssaye et P. de Saint-Victor (Paris: Morizot, 1864), 8.

31. Quoted by Richard Dellamora, "Pater's Modernism: The Leonardo Essay," *University of Toronto Quarterly*, 47 (1977), 135.

32. Pater, *The Renaissance*, 188.

### Chapter 13: Pater's Mythic Fiction: Gods in a Gilded Age, M. F. Moran

1. See, for example, Robert Peters, "The Cult of the Returned Apollo: Walter Pater's *Renaissance* and *Imaginary Portraits*," *Journal of Pre-Raphaelite Studies*, 2 (1981), 53-69; and Gerald Monsman, *Walter Pater's Art of Autobiography* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1980), 5.

2. R. T. Lenaghan, "Pattern in Walter Pater's Fiction," *Studies in Philology*, 58 (1961), 69-91.

3. *Ibid.*, 74, 76.

4. Sloane Frazier, "Two Pagan Studies: Pater's 'Denys L'Auxerrois' and 'Apollo in Picardy'," *Folklore*, 81 (1970), 280-81.

5. Wolfgang Iser, *Walter Pater: The Aesthetic Moment*, David Henry Wilson, trans. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), 126; Steven Connor, "Myth as Multiplicity in Walter Pater's *Greek Studies* and 'Denys L'Auxerrois'," *Review of English Studies*, n.s. 34 (1983), 28-42.

6. Lenaghan, "Pattern in Walter Pater's Fiction," 74.

7. *Ibid.*, 75.

8. Quoted in James Kissane, "Victorian Mythology," *Victorian Studies*, 6 (1962), 9.

9. *Ibid.*, 14.

10. Janet Burstein, "Victorian Mythography and the Progress of the Intellect,"

*Victorian Studies*, 18 (1975), 314.

11. F. C. McGrath, *The Sensible Spirit: Walter Pater and the Modernist Paradigm* (Tampa: University of South Florida Press, 1986), 65.

12. Walter Pater, *Greek Studies: A Series of Essays* (London: Macmillan, 1895), 100.

13. *Ibid.*, 2.

14. *Ibid.*, 45.

15. *Ibid.*, 22-23.

16. *Ibid.*, 3.

17. Christopher Nash, "Myth and Modern Literature," in *The Context of English Literature 1900-1930*, Michael Bell, ed. (London: Methuen, 1980), 166, 167.

18. McGrath, 149-50.

19. Pater, *Greek Studies*, 13.

20. *Ibid.*, 95.

21. *Ibid.*, 22.

22. *Ibid.*, 23.

23. R. D. Stock, *The Holy and the Daemonic from Sir Thomas Browne to William Blake* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982), 17.

24. Pater, *Greek Studies*, 16.

25. *Ibid.*, 13-14.

26. *Ibid.*, 111.

27. *Ibid.*, 23.

28. *Ibid.*, 111.

29. Ibid., 37.

30. Ibid., 28-29. Gerald Monsman identifies the centrifugal tendency with Dionysus, the centripetal with Apollo. He suggests that Pater's own aesthetic propensity for order, rationality, and the ultimate expression of the Absolute can be seen in his typical (Apollonian) heroes who nonetheless share with Dionysus an incarnation "in time and space . . . enduring the pangs of death" (*Pater's Portraits: Mythic Patterns in the Fiction of Walter Pater* [Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1967], 18, 22). It is worth noting, however, that in "Denys L'Auxerrois" and "Apollo in Picardy" the displaced god figures seem to share many common features, and these similarities tend to overshadow Nietzschean readings like those of Monsman and Lenaghan. The association of both Denys and Apollyon with such characteristics as natural vitality, creative individuality, and strangeness is highlighted at the expense of the traditional distinctions made between Dionysus and Apollo in classical mythology. Indeed, some scholars suggest that the cults of the two gods were eventually assimilated one by the other in the classical world (see, for instance Walter F. Otto, *Dionysus: Myth and Cult*, Robert B. Palmer, trans. [Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1965], 207).

31. Pater, *Greek Studies*, 31.

32. Ibid., 140; emphasis added.

33. Connor, "Myth as Multiplicity," 30-31. Connor goes on to point out (32-33) that "Pater apprehended myth as always in a state of Becoming" and "was little interested in patterns of historical reconciliation and progression." But Connor also admits that Pater's "relativistic viewpoint" necessarily implicates the "contemporary world" in moments of historical conflict between "earlier" and "later ways of thinking": a position that supports Pater's concern with *both* "the irresolvable ambiguity of myth" *and*, in my view, its cultural expressiveness.

34. McGrath makes a similar point in considering Pater's expressive and functionalist view of myth: "so with Pater both myth and philosophy express in their respective forms an indwelling spirit that is analogous to the cohesive and informing vision an artist renders in the concrete matter of his art" (201).

35. Cf. Burstein, 319. Burstein usefully charts the growing Victorian concern with the particular mode of thought informing mythic discourse: "Like the mythic mind, the language of myth seemed to have fused subjective and objective impressions; thus, in myth single words gathered many aspects of experiential phenomena into dense but coherent symbols."

36. Cf. Connor, 42, who makes a similar point but to support a more traditional reading of "Denys L'Auxerrois" as a tale which momentarily resolves

contradictions rather than emphasizing their inevitability in the modern age.

37. Walter Pater, "Apollo in Picardy," in *Miscellaneous Studies: A Series of Essays* (London: Macmillan, 1899), 122.

38. Walter Pater, "Denys L'Auxerrois," in *Imaginary Portraits* (London: Macmillan, 1896), 64.

39. See, for example, Robert and Janice A. Keefe, *Walter Pater and the Gods of Disorder* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 1988), 136. They connect these mythic stories to the Victorian debate between Hebraism and Hellenism.

40. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 124, 122.

41. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 78.

42. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 136. Sloane Frazier in "Two Pagan Studies" links monastery and pigeon-house in terms of their "artificiality and complacency" which Apollyon destroys in order to re-assert his "pagan harmony" (283-84).

43. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 133.

44. *Ibid.*, 131.

45. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 80-81.

46. *Ibid.*

47. See Christine van Boheemen-Saaf, *Between Sacred and Profane: Narrative Design and the Logic of Myth from Chaucer to Coover* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1987). Mythic decomposition involves the distribution of a "complex of attributes" between different but related individuals. Pater does not literally split his mythological counterparts, but metaphorically suggests they are uneasily divided between opposing characteristics by signalling certain inexplicable but sudden reversals in their behaviour and demeanour. For example, Hermes finds Denys "like a double creature, of two natures, difficult or impossible to harmonise" (*Imaginary Portraits*, 75).

48. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 73.

49. *Ibid.*, 87.

50. Claude Lévi-Strauss, "The Structural Study of Myth," in *Structural*

*Anthropology*, Claire Jacobson and Brooke Grundfest Schoepf, trans. (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1972), 226.

51. F. C. McGrath's treatment of Denys and Apollyon offers a similar perspective not so much through the expression of difference but by focussing on the artistic potential of the characters. For McGrath they represent a concept of "the artist as an alien figure cleansing his age" (98). However, such a reading does not take full account of the ways in which cleansing and creativity are simultaneously activated and thwarted in the narrative.

52. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 67, 68.

53. *Ibid.*, 68-69.

54. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 122.

55. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 87.

56. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 144.

57. *Ibid.*, 123, 122.

58. Nash, "Myth and Modern Literature," 166.

59. Roland Barthes, *Mythologies*, Annette Lavers, trans. (London: Granada, 1973), 109.

60. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 70-71.

61. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 132.

62. *Ibid.*, 146.

63. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 57, 88.

64. *Ibid.*, 60, 59, 75.

65. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 135.

66. Pater, *Imaginary Portraits*, 63-64; emphasis added.

67. *Ibid.*, 76.

68. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 131, 138.

## Chapter 14: Pater and Architecture, Bernard Richards

1. *The Works of Walter Pater*, 8 vols. (London: Macmillan, 1910), I, 210.
2. *Ibid.*, I, 210-11. In his edition of *The Renaissance* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1980), Donald Hill identifies the source of the comparison as Hegel's *Aesthetik*, I, 449-50 (trans. Knox, I, 358).
3. For a survey, see James S. Curl, *The Egyptian Revival* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1982).
4. The "Postscript" was originally published as "Romanticism" in *Macmillan's Magazine* (November 1876). It was revised for *Miscellaneous Studies* (1895), and the final paragraph was added.
5. *Works of Pater*, I, x.
6. *Ibid.*, V, 245.
7. *Ibid.*, V, 249.
8. *Ibid.*, VIII, 132-33.
9. In *The Dilemma of Style: Architectural Ideas from the Picturesque to the Post-Modern* (London: John Murray, 1987).
10. *Works of Pater*, III, 123.
11. *Ibid.*, III, 118.
12. *Ibid.*, IV, 50.
13. *Ibid.*, IV, 49.
14. *Ibid.*, VI, 279.
15. *Ibid.*, VIII, 127.

16. Ibid., VIII, 138-39.

17. Ibid., VIII, 140.

18. Ibid., VIII, 141.

19. Ibid., VIII, 139.

20. Ibid., IX, 5.

21. Ibid., IX, 6.

22. Ibid., VIII, 109.

23. Ibid., VIII, 110.

24. Ibid., VIII, 115.

25. Ibid., VIII, 113-14.

26. Ibid., VIII, 119.

27. Ibid., VIII, 119.

28. Ibid., VIII, 135.

29. Ibid., IX, 77-78.

30. Ibid., I, 134.

31. Ibid., VIII, 178.

32. Ibid., VIII, 148.

33. Ibid., VIII, 152.

34. Ibid., VIII, 154.

35. Ibid., VI, 279.

36. Ibid., VIII, 155.

37. Ibid., I, 176.

38. Ibid., V, 23.

39. Ibid., V, 261.

40. In quoting this passage from the "Postscript" to *Miscellaneous Studies* (127) J. M. Crook mistakenly dates it 1874. In fact it is an addition of 1889. This means that it was written *after* work on T. G. Jackson's extraordinarily eclectic New Quad had begun at Pater's college, Brasenose.

41. All of these buildings are illustrated in Mark Girouard's *The Victorian Country House* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979) and his *Sweetness and Light: the 'Queen Anne' Movement 1860-1910* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1977).

## Chapter 15: The Crystal Man: A Study of "Diaphaneitè", *Anne Varty*

1. See Gerald Monsman, "Pater, Hopkins, and Fichte's Ideal Student," *SAQ* 70 (1971), 365-76; and "Pater's Aesthetic Hero," *UTQ* 40 (1971), 136-51. See also B. A. Inman, *Walter Pater's Reading: A Bibliography of His Library Borrowings and Literary References 1858-1873* (New York: Garland, 1981), 74-75.

2. Walter Pater, "Diaphaneitè," *Miscellaneous Studies*, C. L. Shadwell, ed. (London: Macmillan, 1895), 259. The very title of the essay is mysterious. *Diaphaneitè* is not an English word, nor, as the accentuation suggests, is it a French word. If we transliterate *Diaphaneitè* into ancient Greek, it assumes the form of a second person plural imperative verb: "[You shall] become transparent!" or "shine through!" This reinforces the sense of the essay as a manifesto or imperative command for the future.

3. Inman, 74-75.

4. Monsman, "Pater's Aesthetic Hero," 137-40.

5. Donald L. Hill, ed., *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1980), 410-43.

6. Walter Pater, "Winckelmann," *Westminster Review* ns. 31 (1867), 94.

7. "Diaphaneitè," 258.

8. *The Renaissance*, 189.
9. Walter Pater, *Plato and Platonism* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 135.
10. For Pater's early interest in Carlyle, see Inman, 7.
11. See Monsman, "Pater, Hopkins, and Fichte's Ideal Student."
12. Thomas Carlyle, "The Hero as Poet," *On Heroes and Hero-Worship and the Heroic in History*, H. D. Traill, ed.; *The Works of Thomas Carlyle*, (London: Chapman and Hall, 1897-99), V, 105.
13. Thomas Carlyle, *The French Revolution: A History* (1837), *Works*, III, 46.
14. "Diaphaneitè," 256.
15. G. H. Lewes, *The Life of Goethe* (1855; London: Smith, Elder and Co. [1863], 1864). A letter from Anthony Trollope to Lewes, dated 13 December 1863, thanking him for a copy of the *Life*, confirms its publication date. See *The George Eliot Letters*, Gordon S. Haight, ed. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1978), VIII, 315. While there is no bibliographical evidence that Pater ever borrowed this book from a library, and he did not own a copy of it, Pater's interest in Goethe was so lively and the book so influential, that it is most improbable that he was not familiar with it.
16. Lewes, 259, 277, 299.
17. *Ibid.*, 20.
18. "Diaphaneitè," 257.
19. Inman, 49.
20. G. W. F. Hegel, *Aesthetics: Lectures on Fine Art*, T. M. Knox, trans. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1975), I, 20.
21. "Winckelmann," 112.
22. Hegel, II, 712-13.
23. *Ibid.*, 713.

24. "Diaphaneitè," 255; and "Winckelmann," 103.
25. "Winckelmann," 99.
26. Lewes, 222.
27. "Diaphaneitè," 258.
28. "Winckelmann," 84.
29. "Diaphaneitè," 254-55; and "Winckelmann," 88-89.
30. "Diaphaneitè," 254; and "Winckelmann," 102.
31. "Diaphaneitè," 255.
32. "Winckelmann," 103.
33. *Ibid.*, 80.
34. *Ibid.*, 88.
35. Carlyle, *Works*, V, 81.
36. Pater, "Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits* (London: Macmillan, 1910), 152. This choice of diction may have been influenced by Kant's essay "Beantwortung der Frage: Was ist Aufklärung?" which ends by distinguishing between finished and unfinished process: "Leben wir jetzt in einem *aufgeklärten* Zeitalter? . . . Nein, aber whol in einem Zeitalter der *Aufklärung*." *Kants Gesammelte Schriften*, hersg. Königlich Preussischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, (Berlin: Georg Reimer, 1912), VIII, 40.
37. "Duke Carl of Rosenmold," 153.
38. *Ibid.*, 122-23.
39. "Diaphaneitè," 255.
40. "Winckelmann," 86.
41. "Duke Carl of Rosenmold," 126-27.

42. J. D. Passavant, *Rafael von Urbino und sein Vater Giovanni Santi* (Leipzig: F. A. Brockhaus, 1839), I, 302.
43. Johannes Winckelmann, Brief "An Berendis," Nothenitz, 17 Sept. 1754, *Briefe*. hersg. Walter Rehm (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1952-1957), I, 153.
44. Ibid., Brief "112 An Berendis," Dresden, 4 June 1755, *Briefe*, I, 176.
45. Ibid., my translation.
46. "Duke Carl of Rosenmold," 129.
47. "Winckelmann," 107.
48. "Duke Carl of Rosenmold," 133.
49. Ibid., 145.
50. Ibid., 143; and Goethe, *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre*, Erich Trunz, hersg. *Goethes Werke. Hamburger Ausgabe*. (Hamburg: Erich Trunz, 1967), VII, 431.
51. Lewes, *Life of Goethe*, 170.
52. "Duke Carl of Rosenmold," 153.
53. *Female Characters of Goethe. From the Original Drawings of William Kaulbach. With Explanatory Text by G. H. Lewes* (London: Cassell, Petter, and Galpin, 1867), 23ff. Goethe's own account of the skating episode is in *Dichtung und Wahrheit, Werke*, X, 84-85.

## Chapter 16: Nineteenth Century Responses to Montaigne and Bruno: A Context for Pater, *Jane Spirit*

1. Work by DeLaura, Knoepfmacher, and Young exemplify this approach. See David DeLaura, *Hebrew and Hellene in Victorian England: Newman, Arnold and Pater* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1969); Ulrich Knoepfmacher, *Religious Humanism and the Victorian Novel* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1965); and Helen Young, *The Writings of Walter Pater* (Lancaster: Bryn Mawr College, 1933). More recently Linda Dowling places Pater's choice of a second-century Roman setting against the background of the "significant revaluation" of "the idea of Roman decadence" that occurred during the nineteenth century. James Lubbock also alters the perspective from which *Marius* has been regarded, arguing that Pater's main concern is not with

Marius as a figure of concealed autobiography, but with the historical period represented. See Linda Dowling, "Roman Decadence and Victorian Historiography," *Victorian Studies*, 28 (1985), 579-605; and James Lubbock, "Walter Pater's *Marius the Epicurean*: The Imaginary Portrait," *Journal of the Philological Quarterly*, 41 (1962), 475-91.

2. Patricia Clements demonstrates Pater's immense but concealed debt to Baudelaire, revealed particularly in the portrait of Ronsard in *Gaston*. John Coates traces the submerged intention of *Imaginary Portraits*. Ian Small points out how Pater's work creates a "web of intertextual relationships" and how, as in the case of religious citation, this is used to "controvert" any "simple notion of authority." See Patricia Clements, *Baudelaire and the English Tradition* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985); John Coates, "Aspects of the Intellectual Context of Pater's Imaginary Portraits," *Yearbook of English Studies*, 15 (1985), 93-108; and the Introduction by Ian Small to Walter Pater, *Marius the Epicurean*, Ian Small, ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986).

3. Richard Wollheim, "The Artistic Temperament," *TLS* (22 September 1978), 1045.

4. I am most grateful to Mr. John Sparrow for permission to quote from the manuscripts in his possession. References to these unpublished chapters are denoted MS, followed by chapter and folio numbers.

5. Donald Frame, *Montaigne in France, 1812-1852* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1940), vii.

6. *The New Monthly Magazine and Literary Journal*, 19 January 1827, 28.

7. Walter Landor, *Imaginary Conversations*, T. Earle Welby, ed. (London: Chapman and Hall, 1928), VII, 148.

8. Thomas Carlyle, *Montaigne and other Essays, Chiefly Biographical* (London: James Gowan, 1897), 3.

9. *Ibid.*, 4-6.

10. Cooper-Willis comments that the "the fact that Montaigne has been described by many writers as 'licentious,' in view of certain admissions of laxness in sex matters which he makes, has for many people disposed of the whole question of his 'morality,' as if morality and continence were one and the selfsame thing." See Irene Cooper-Willis, *Montaigne* (London: Alfred A. Knopf, 1927), 13.

11. Alexander Vinet, *Montaigne; The Endless Study, and other Miscellanies*, Robert Turnbull, trans. (New York: M.W. Dodd, 1850), 58.

12. R. W. Church, "The Essays of Montaigne," in *Oxford Essays* (London: John Parker, 1857), 239-283.
13. John Owen, *Skeptics of the French Renaissance* (London: Macmillan, 1893), 423.
14. F. D. Maurice, *Moral and Metaphysical Philosophy* (London: Griffin, Bohn, and Co., 1872), 151.
15. See Arthur Tilley, *The Literature of the French Renaissance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1904), II, 165.
16. Bayle St. John, *Montaigne the Essayist: A Biography* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1858), I, 336.
17. In Lecky's view Montaigne deserved admiration for believing that "it was the part of a wise man to remain poised with an indifferent mind between opposing sects. As a consequence of this he taught . . . the innocence of error and the evil of persecution." W. E. H. Lecky, *The History of the Rise and Influence of the Spirit of Rationalism in Europe* (London: Green, Longmans, Roberts and Green, 1865), II, 63.
18. Matthew Arnold, "On Translating Homer," in *The Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold*, R. H. Super, ed. (Michigan: University of Michigan Press, 1960), I, 174.
19. "Emerson," *Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold*, X, 175.
20. "George Sand," *Ibid.*, 188.
21. Lynn Linton, "A Practical Philosopher," *Chambers Journal of Popular Literature, Science and Art*, 11 (12 May 1894), 291.
22. Walter Pater, *Gaston de Latour* (London: Macmillan, 1896), 138.
23. *Ibid.*, 136.
24. *Ibid.*, 140.
25. *Ibid.*, 141.
26. Pater's influence here may be detected in the enlarged version of "The Portrait of Mr. W. H.," in which Wilde discusses the Renaissance revival of the spirit of Hellenism and of Platonic theory. He mentions, for example, the love of "Michael Angelo" and "Tomasio Cavalieri," saying that: "[t]he same idea is put forward in Montaigne's noble essay on Friendship, a passion which he ranks higher than the love of brother for brother, or the love of man for woman. See

Oscar Wilde, *The Portrait of Mr. W. H.*, Vivyan Holland, ed. (London: Methuen and Co., 1921), 45.

27. *Gaston*, 130.

28. *Ibid.*, 131.

29. *Ibid.*, 117.

30. *Ibid.*, 130-31.

31. *Ibid.*, 112, 144.

32. *Ibid.*, MS, ch. 8, f.21.

33. James Joyce, "The Day of the Rabblement," in *The Critical Writings of James Joyce*, Ellsworth Mason and Richard Ellmann, eds. (London: Faber, 1959), 69.

34. See Giordano Bruno, *The Ash Wednesday Supper*, E. Gosselin and L. Lerner, trans. (Hamden, Connecticut: Archon, 1977), 22f.

35. Frances Yates, *Giordano Bruno and The Hermetic Tradition* (1964; London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1978), 450.

36. S. T. Coleridge, *The Friend* (1809; London: Gale and Curtis, 1812), 89.

37. Henry Hallam, *Introduction to the Literature of Europe in the Fifteenth, Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries* (Paris: Bawdry's European Library, 1839), II, 92.

38. *Ibid.*, II, 96.

39. Billie Andrew Inman, *Walter Pater's Reading 1858-1873*, (New York: Garland, 1981), 66.

40. J. H. Browne, "Giordano Bruno," *Atlantic Monthly*, 38 (Nov. 1876), 557.

41. *Ibid.*, 550.

42. In his address given on 9 August 1874, Tyndall suggested that by his insistence that "[m]atter is not the mere naked, empty *capacity* which philosophers have pictured her to be, but the universal mother" Bruno had come close to modern scientific thought. See John Tyndall, *Fragments of Science* (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1879), 156.

43. Ian Frith comments that "by the way of poetry Bruno became a philosopher; Love of art made him a lover of men; love of the true and beautiful made him the worshipper of God." See Ian Frith, *The Life of Giordano Bruno* (London: Trubner, 1887), 307.
44. Lewes portrays Bruno as "a preacher, young, handsome, gay, and worldly as a poet, not as a fanatic." See G. H. Lewes, *Biographical History of Philosophy* (1845-1846; London: Parker and Son, 1857), 316.
45. Annie Besant, *Giordano Bruno* (London: Watts and Co., 1887), 1.
46. Isa Blagden, "Giordano Bruno," *Fraser's Magazine*, 3 (Mar. 1871), 364; Arthur Moss, *Bruno and Spinoza* (London: Watts and Co., 1885), 3.
47. R. C. Christie examined the evidence for Bruno having died at the stake and found it to be incontrovertible. His findings were disputed by J. P. B. Stuart, who scorned those wanting to erect a monument to Bruno's memory, a view which was in its turn dismissed by C. E. Plumptre. See: R. C. Christie, "Was Giordano Bruno Really Burned?" *Macmillan's Magazine*, 52 (May-Oct. 1885), 435-40; J. P. B. Stuart, *Essays on Foreign Subjects* (London: Alexander Gardner, 1901); and C. E. Plumptre, "Giordano Bruno and the Scottish Reviewer," *Antiquary* 19 (March and April 1889), 110-14 and 146-51.
48. *Agnostic Annual* (1885), 23.
49. A. C. Swinburne, "The Monument of Giordano Bruno," in *Swinburne's Collected Poetical Works* (London: Heinemann, 1924), 1081-82.
50. J. A. Symonds, *The Renaissance in Italy* (London: Smith, Elder and Co., 1886), VII, 139.
51. C. E. Plumptre, "Giordano Bruno: His Life and Philosophy," *Westminster Review*, 132 (August 1889), 117-37.
52. Karl Blind, "Giordano Bruno and the New Italy," *Nineteenth Century* 26 (July 1889), 115 and 119.
53. Walter Pater, "Giordano Bruno, Paris: 1586," *Fortnightly Review*, 46 (August 1889), 234. Apart from the additional introduction establishing the figure of Gaston listening to Bruno there are no great differences between the article and chapter versions. However, the chapter does insert a new paragraph emphasizing the significance of Bruno's doctrine of indifference to Gaston (*Gaston*, 196-97). Other changes slightly alter the emphasis of the later version. In the article version, for example, Pater writes of how Bruno "the escaped monk, is still a monk: his philosophy, impious as it might seem to some, a new religion" ("Giordano Bruno," 241). In the chapter version this is made more emphatic by the alteration of the last clause to "a religion; very new indeed, yet a religion" (*Gaston*, 191). The "earlier physical impulses" which make Bruno always a "lover and a monk" despite the superseding of "religion and love" by intellectual ardour

("Giordano Bruno," 238) are, in the book version, made more specifically "physically erotic" impulses (*Gaston*, 181), associated with Bruno's early enthusiasm for "religion and physical love" (*Gaston*, 183).

54. *Gaston*, 175.

55. *Ibid.*, 183.

56. *Ibid.*, 123.

57. *Ibid.*, 161.

58. *Ibid.*, 200.

59. *Ibid.*, MS, ch. 9, f. 16.

60. *Ibid.*, ch. 9, f. 17.

61. *Ibid.*, ch. 9, f. 21.

62. *Ibid.*, ch. 10, f. 13.

63. *Ibid.*, ch. 10, f. 14.

64. *Ibid.*, ch. 10, f. 32.

65. *Ibid.*, ch. 10, f. 33.

66. *Ibid.*, ch. 10, f. 33.

67. *Ibid.*, ch. 10, f. 37.

68. *Ibid.*, ch. 10, f. 37.

69. *Ibid.*, ch. 9, f. 6 and ch. 11, f. 37.

70. *Ibid.*, ch. 11, f. 35.

71. *Ibid.*, ch. 13, f. 21.

