

6.

THE IMPACT OF MUSIC EDUCATION ON HOME, SCHOOL, AND COMMUNITY

Edward P. Asmus

The University of Miami

GOALS

The purpose of this literature review is to provide a broad overview of the impact of music education on the home, school, and community environment. The literature included encompasses attitudes, burden of music instruction such as extraneous noise, space, and so on, beliefs of the value of musical involvement, quality of life, public relations value, and the identity of family, school, and community. These factors guide the entire review process of this chapter.

REVIEW PROCEDURES

Resources

The resources of the University of Miami Libraries were employed to implement extensive searches of published literature on the impact of music education. The University of Miami Libraries provides access to over 270 electronic databases covering all areas of human endeavor. Of particular usefulness to this effort were the electronic databases of Silverplatter that include PsycInfo, Mental Measurements Yearbook, Exceptional Child Education Resources, and ERIC, RILM Abstracts of Music Literature, Music Index Online, CSA Illumina that includes Sociological Abstracts, and the Social Science Citation Index. In addition, the Frost School of Music is home to the Music Education Search System a reference database of every major

refereed journal in the field of music education published in the United States. The number of citations in this database now totals more than 17,000.

Process

Three research assistants with significant research and publication experiences were assigned a particular area: home, school, or community. They then separately searched through databases and other research resources looking for published works that included the word “music”, the particular area, and other keywords that might bring forth references that incorporate those factors the review was to encompass. Weekly meetings were held between the three assistants and myself to monitor progress, to share insights, and to enhance the review process. The results of extensive search efforts yielded very few references that specifically detailed the impact of music education on home, school, and community. As a check on the small number of identified references, the indices of the two handbooks of music teaching research (Colwell, 1992; Colwell & Richardson, 2002) were examined. These two works offer some of the most comprehensive literature reviews in the field of music education. The terms “home” and “school” are not listed separately in either index. The term “community” is listed in the index of the more recent volume. In short, it appears that these entities have not been of great interest to researchers in the field.

Confirmatory Review

To confirm the paucity of findings obtained by the research assistants, I conducted an independent literature search. The indices searched and the keywords used for each search are listed in Table 1. The searches were adapted to each database to fit the characteristics of the search engine. The searches targeted directly salient references to the impact of music education on home, school, and community. Very few references were found.

Table 1
Confirmatory Literature Review

Indexes Searched	Keywords
Dissertations On-Line	Music in Title and (home or school or community or society)
ERIC	Music and (effect on home or effect on school or effect on community or effect on society) Music and (impact on home or impact on school or impact on community or impact on society) Music and social effects
Music Education Search System	Music and (effect on home or effect on school or effect on community or effect on society) Music and (impact on home or impact on school or impact on community or impact on society) Music and social effects
Music Index	Music and (effect on home or effect on school or effect on community or effect on society) Music and (impact on home or impact on school or impact on community or impact on society) Music and social effects
RILM	(effect on school) or ((effect on school)or(impact on school)) or ((music education)and(effect)) or ((music education)and(impact)) or ((impact on society)or(effect on society)) or (social outcome) or ((impact on community)or(effect on community)) or ((impact on community)or(effect on community)) or ((impact on home)or(effect on home))
Sociology Index	Music in Title and (home or school or community or society)

IMPACT OF MUSIC EDUCATION ON THE HOME

Home Environment and Learning

Home environment has long been known to be one of the most influential factors on student learning (Garber & Ware, 1972; Olson, 1984; Shapiro & Bloom, 1977). Influences of the home include socio-economic status, enrichment, parental attitude, genetics, and the like. These

influences have been cited as accounting for up to 80% of the variance in learning. It is in the home that students learn attitudes toward learning and school (Revicki, 1981), where achievement motivation is learned (Palmer, 1967), and from where parental involvement, that is so influential in student learning, emanates (Slaughter & Epps, 1987). Genetic factors have been shown to explain 25% of the known relationship between home environment and achievement (Cleveland, Jacobson, Lipinski, & Rowe, 2000).

The major influence that the home has had on student achievement has been shown for reading (Anglum, 1990; Dolan, 1983), mathematics (Crane, 1996), and science (Abeti, 1983; Gorman & Yu, 1990). Characteristics of the home environments of high achievers are supervision, organization, parental involvement, and parental communication (Diaz Soto, 1988). Importantly, it has been shown that positive changes in the home environment can produce increases in academic achievement (Kalinowski & Sloane, 1981).

The importance of the home environment on student learning is apparent from this brief summative review. Brand (1986) studied the impact of the home musical environment on student musical learning. As part of this project, Brand developed the Home Musical Environmental Scale that measured parent attitude toward music, musical involvement with the child, concert attendance, ownership and use of recordings, and whether a parent plays an instrument. When this measure was used with assessments of tonal and rhythm perception, musical knowledge, skill in musical performance, music reading, and motivation for music it was found that home musical environment was strongly related to musical achievement of the second grade students involved in the study.

Students know the importance of the home in music learning. Using statements students wrote about what caused success and failure in music, Asmus (1985, 1986) found a clearly

delineated family background factor. This factor included statements such as “having musical parents,” “having relatives who are musical,” “starting music when you are very young,” “having music run in your family,” and “being able to afford a good musical instrument.”

The home environment can be altered by the presence of music (Shiraishi, 1997). Music has been shown to be an effective method for relieving stress, curbing anxiety, reducing depression, and enhancing self-esteem. When music is systematically presented within the home environment, positive effects can be noted in family members.

Effect of Music on Child Development

Hanshumaker (1980) performed a comprehensive review of the literature on the effects of arts education on intellectual development. His review indicated that children value music activities, music fosters positive attitudes toward school, music results in lower rates of absenteeism, music contributes to the development of creativity, music positively influences social development, and music activities have a positive effect on general intellectual development. The literature reviewed also indicated that school time spent on music activities does not negatively impact scores on standardized tests or overall grade point average. Higgins (1966) noted that participation in high school band neither positively or negatively effected academic achievement or social adjustment. Student involvement with music in school settings has been shown to promote confidence, enjoyment of school, and cause more reading at home (Sharman, 1981).

A study by Simpson (1969) that employed creativity tests developed by J. P. Guilford found that music is better at promoting general creative potential than non-musical subjects. He also found that some music courses do this better than others. Choir, music appreciation, and beginning instrument courses promoted one measure of creativity, word fluency, best. Band,

piano, and harmony classes best-promoted spontaneous flexibility, another of the creativity measures. All music classes tended to promote the creativity measure of elaboration.

Pirtle and Seaton (1973) studied the effect of musical experiences on neurologically handicapped children. They noted that the neurologically handicapped children developed a functional understanding of musical concepts quicker and better than spatial, temporal, and ordinal concepts. These children demonstrated a keen sensitivity to music.

IMPACT OF MUSIC EDUCATION ON THE SCHOOL

School Climate

Music is perceived as a positive addition to the school curriculum (Sahr, 2000). Indeed, school administrators perceive music as a positive and effective addition for students' total educational experience (Beczka, 1997). However, financial pressures make it difficult for administrators to support music programs at an appropriate level. Schools infused with the arts have been shown to produce higher student grades and more positive teacher assessments of students (Amaral, 1991; Lathrop & Boyle, 1972).

Effect of Music on Learning

Corenblum and Marshall (1998) tested a model to predict students continuing in high school band. They found that the best predictors were socioeconomic level and teacher predictions of intentions to continue. Another important factor was the support provided the band programs by parents, schools, and the band teachers.

Music competitions have been an on-going concern for the field of music education. Hurley (1996) studied the psychological and social impact of music competition. He found that competitions can have negative effects on student effort and student motivation. Situations that threaten students may cause students to withhold effort. While external evaluation of student

musical performance may cause short-term performance gains, in the long-term such evaluations can reduce student motivation. This is particularly true for black students. Hurley suggests that cooperative environments promote student learning and positive long-term motivation for the vast majority of students and are much more beneficial to student growth.

Schneider and Klotz (2000) studied the effect of participating in music and athletics on standardized test scores. The study found that mean scores were higher for musicians over those of athletes and for students who did not participate in either music or athletics. The authors also found that the gap between musicians and athletes increased with continued participation.

Effect of Music on the Learner

Self-esteem is an important predictive variable in student achievement. Students with more positive self-esteem perform better in school. Vander Ark, Nolin, and Newman (1980) studied the role of gender and self-esteem in predicting attitudes toward music activities. They found that self-esteem was a significant predictor in attitudes toward music activities. Self-esteem was a more powerful predictor than social status, gender, and age. As age increases, attitudes toward music activities decline. Middle social status students have more positive attitudes toward music than those of high or low social status. The least favored of all music activities studied was that of music reading.

Effect of Music on Learning Non-Musical Subjects

Music has been shown to be a positive factor in language learning (Hanshumaker, 1980). Van Asselt (1970) looked at how rhyme, rhythm, song melody, and poems influenced third grade students learning of German. She found that the musical activities were beneficial in the promotion of student learning of German.

Omniewski and Habursky (1998) studied the influence of arts infusion on math achievement. They found that arts infusion students had significantly higher math achievement scores than a control group of subjects who received math instruction without the arts. Higher math scores were also obtained by groups of students who received contingent music listening by Madsen and Forsythe (1973). In this study, students could earn time to listen to music as a reward for the number of correct responses to math problems. The study indicates that music can be a powerful motivator for improving math scores.

Music has been used to teach geographical concepts with success (Lehr, 1984). Battle and Ramsey (1990) incorporated social studies facts into the words of a song. The researchers taught this song using both cognitive and psychomotor skills. They found that this strategy was effective in aiding the students' social studies fact recall. Importantly, the students found the song learning experience to be enjoyable and motivating. The song group scored better on a social studies fact test than a control group. Similar positive outcomes have been found for the use of music in aiding social studies learning by Rosenbloom (2004).

IMPACT OF MUSIC EDUCATION ON THE COMMUNITY

Community Needs and Benefits of Music

Burmeister (1955), in a comprehensive effort to learn community attitudes toward music in public schools, surveyed community members as to what is liked or disliked about the way music is taught, what changes should be made to the teaching of music and what is liked or disliked about the music teacher. The study found that the communities surveyed were most concerned that all students have access to music instruction and that students learn to perform music either through singing or playing an instrument. Performance quality, a commonly waived banner in the field of music education, was not important to the public. What was important was

that there be more access to music. The quality of the music teacher was more aligned with quality of personality than it was teacher knowledge, musicianship, and disciplinary ability. The communities wanted better known music to be used, more time spent teaching the appreciation of good music, and performances by performing groups.

Martin (1995) has indicated that musical meaning must be understood as socially constructed rather than as inherent within the music. He points out that music comes from the community. By extension, he is concerned that the notion there is a correspondence between social structures and musical structures is probably not accurate. Walker (1989) is also concerned that music instruction reflects society's understanding and approach to music. He believes that the simplistic reduction of music instruction into sequential skill acquisition is not a fruitful approach.

Music and Youth Culture

Music is important to most adolescents. Generally, the music to which adolescents are attracted is not the music taught in most school music classes. North, Hargreaves, and O'Neill (2000) studied the way adolescents listen to and perform music. They found that listening to music was the most preferred indoor activity, but was not preferred more than outdoor activities and involvement with pop music was perceived to have different benefits to involvement with classical music. The researchers conclude that music is important because it allows adolescents to portray an image to the outside world and it satisfies their emotional needs.

Knowledge of pop music was a source of prestige for low achievers. LaVoie and Collins (1975) found that when students listened to rock music when studying, their academic performance was lower than when listening to classical music or not listening to any music. Norrby (2000) found that when verbally describing familiar music girls tend to use concrete,

specific, and unmitigated descriptions. When describing unfamiliar music, the descriptions are tentative, hypothetical, and imprecise.

Music and Behavior

Music can have a profound effect on behavior. Arnett (1991) found that adolescents who like heavy metal report a wider range of reckless behavior than those who don't. Wyatt (2002) offers a strategy for modifying behavior of male juvenile offenders using musical activities. Through these strategies, improvements in impulse control, social skills, and appropriate self-expression can be obtained.

Brown and O'Leary (1971) investigated the role of pop music within an English secondary school system. They found that exposure to pop music was inversely related to academic achievement. In contrast, Epstein, Pratto, and Skipper (1990) found that musical preference was not related to behavioral problems.

IMPLICATIONS FOR LEARNING

The home environment and its associated factors are the primary determinants of student learning. This is true for music as it is for other subjects. Involving parents in the total music teaching process is important for student success. Research indicates that if appropriate strategies are applied, the actual home environment can be modified to more effectively influence positive achievement outcomes.

Music within schools is perceived as a positive factor for the total education of children. Unfortunately because music creates sound others sometime perceive as noise, music classrooms tend to be off by themselves within the physical plant of schools. This inevitably leads to separation from the school consciousness. Music teachers need to be cognizant of this fact and do all they can to integrate music within the school environment. The literature also suggests that

cooperative learning environments are more effective in the long-term. Continuing emphasis by many performance-based music education programs on competitions should be rethought.

Communities are supportive of music in the schools. However, where professional music educators tend to stress the quality of music performance, communities would rather have access for a larger number of students and more performances by the ensembles of the school. Obtuse music written specifically for school groups should be offset by the use of music that is more familiar to the communities that house the schools. It is interesting to note that research shows that it is not pop music that the communities want, it is better known music. Popular music does seem to have a place in motivating adolescents for musical learning. However, it should not be the totality of the instruction. Communities want their students to be taught “good” music and to learn its appreciation.

IMPLICATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

At the outset of this literature review it was noted that there is very little research on the impact of music education in the home, school, and community. This is research that is sorely needed. The music education research community has been focused on addressing issues associated with the actual teaching and learning of music. It has not been focused on the outcomes of music education. Certainly solid evidence of how music instruction in schools influences the home, the school, and the community would do much to validate having music in the schools. More importantly, it would give insights as to how music education could better serve its broader constituencies.

IMPLICATIONS FOR POLICY MAKERS

The research is clear. Music has a powerful impact on student learning, it enhances the totality of the school experience, and produces positive student outcomes throughout the

academic enterprise. This occurs even when students are taken out of their other subject matter courses to participate in music. Policy makers should note that greater academic achievement in reading, mathematics, and the sciences could be enhanced by viable music offerings within schools.

The other item that stands out in this review is the extremely important role of the home in determining student achievement and that the home environment can be modified to better support student achievement. The home and its associated factors are the single most important determinant of student success. This role cannot be disregarded. Recently, policy makers have been placing great emphasis on the organization of school and the role of teachers in the learning equation. This emphasis looks at an area that is only about 20% of the reasons for student success. The home environment and its relationship with the school and teachers must be considered in educational policy to more effectively reform the Nation's schools as it accounts for 80% of reasons for student achievement in schools.

REFERENCES

- Abeti, S. L. (1983). *The relationship between social environment in the home & achievement in science--Uganda. African studies in curriculum development & evaluation*. Nairobi, Kenya: African Curriculum Organisation. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED250154)
- Amaral, A. L. (1991). Cultural capital and school success: A study of Brazilian normal schools. (Doctoral dissertation, Stanford University). *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 52 (09), 3131A.
- Anglum, B. S. (1990). Prediction of elementary student reading achievement from specific home environment variables. *Reading Improvement*, 27(3), 173-184.
- Arnett, J. (1991). Heavy metal music and reckless behavior among adolescents. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 20(6), 573-592.
- Asmus, E. P. (1985). The development of a multidimensional instrument for the measurement of affective responses to music. *Psychology of Music*, 13, 19-30.

- Asmus, E. P. (1986). Student beliefs about the causes of success and failure in music: A study of achievement motivation. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 34*, 262-278.
- Battle, J. B., & Ramsey, D. S. (1990). Music as an aid in learning conceptual facts in the social studies lesson. *Southeastern Journal of Music Education, 2*, 221-237.
- Beczka, M. J. (1997). The perceptions of secondary administrators regarding the role of the fine arts curriculum in the total education experience. (Doctoral dissertation, Saint Louis University). *Dissertation Abstracts International, 58* (08), 2889A.
- Brand, M. (1986). Relationship between home musical environment and selected musical attributes of second-grade children. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 34*, 112-120.
- Brown, R. L., & O'Leary, M. (1971). Pop music in an English secondary school system. *American Behavioral Scientist, 14*(3), 401-414.
- Burmeister, C. A. (1955). A study of community attitudes toward music education in the public schools of selected communities in Missouri. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 3*, 77-91.
- Cleveland, H. H., Jacobson, K. C., Lipinski, J. J., & Rowe, D. C. (2000). Genetic and shared environmental contributions to the relationship between the home environment and child and adolescent achievement. *Intelligence, 28*(1), 69-86.
- Colwell, R. (Ed.). (1992). *Handbook of research on music teaching and learning*. New York: Schirmer Books.
- Colwell, R., & Richardson, C. (Eds.). (2002). *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Corenblum, B., & Marshall, E. (1998). The band played on: Predicting students' intentions to continue studying music. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 46*, 128-140.
- Crane, J. (1996). Effects of home environment, SES, and maternal test scores on mathematics achievement. *Journal of Educational Research, 89*, 305-314.
- Diaz Soto, L. (1988). *The home environment and Puerto Rican children's achievement: A researcher's diary*. Paper presented at the National Association for Bilingual Education Conference (Houston, TX, April 27-May 1, 1988). (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED299341)
- Dolan, L. (1983). The prediction of reading achievement and self-esteem from an index of home educational environment: A study of urban elementary students. *Measurement and Evaluation in Guidance, 16*(2), 86-94.

- Epstein, J. S., Pratto, D. J., & Skipper, J. K., Jr. (1990). Teenagers, behavioral problems, and preferences for heavy metal and rap music: A case study of a southern middle school. *Deviant Behavior, 11*(4), 381-394.
- Garber, M., & Ware, W. B. (1972). The home environment as a predictor of school achievement. *Theory into Practice, 11*(3), 190-195.
- Gorman, S., & Yu, C. C. (1990). *Science achievement and home environment: National assessment of educational progress 1985-1986*. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (Boston, MA, April 16-20, 1990). (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED330702)
- Hanschumaker, J. (1980). The effects of arts education on intellectual and social development: A review of selected research. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 61*, 10-28.
- Higgins, W. (1966). *A study of the effect of participation in a high school band on academic achievement and social adjustment*. Unpublished masters thesis, University of Miami, Coral Gables, FL.
- Hurley, C. G. (1996). Musical chairs: The psychological and social impact of competition. *Dialog in Instrumental Music Education, 20*(2), 74-87.
- Kalinowski, A., & Sloane, K. (1981). The home environment and school achievement. *Studies in Educational Evaluation, 7*(1), 85-96.
- Lathrop, R. L., & Boyle, J. D. (1972). Interdisciplinary model program in the arts for children and teachers: An interim report on the arts impact project. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 29*, 1-8.
- LaVoie, J. C., & Collins, B. R. (1975). Effect of youth culture music on high school students' academic performance. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence, 4*(1), 57-65.
- Lehr, J. C. (1984). Music as an aid in the teaching of geography. *History and Social Science Teacher, 19*(4), 223-228.
- Madsen, C. K., & Forsythe, J. L. (1973). The effect of contingent music listening on increases of mathematical responses. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 21*, 176-181.
- Martin, P. J. (1995). *Sounds and society: Themes in the sociology of music*. Manchester, England: Manchester University Press.
- Norrby, C. (2000). Youth speech, youth identities, and music worlds in Sweden: Four high-school girls describe music. *Text, 20*(4), 569-602.
- North, A. C., Hargreaves, D. J., & O'Neill, S. A. (2000). The importance of music to adolescents. *British Journal of Educational Psychology, 70*(2), 255-272.

- Olson, C. C. (1984). *Effects of parenting and home environment on student achievement in grades 3 to 5* (Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (68th, New Orleans, LA, April 23-27, 1984).(ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED247002)
- Omniewski, R. A., & Habursky, B. (1998). The effect of arts infusion on math achievement among second grade students. *Contributions to Music Education, 25*(2), 38-50.
- Palmer, J. A. (1967). *Home environment and achievement*. Toronto, ON: Toronto Board of Education Research Department). (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED066403)
- Pirtle, M., & Seaton, K. P. (1973). Use of music training to actuate conceptual growth in neurologically handicapped children. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 21*, 292-301.
- Revicki, D. A. (1981). *The relationship among socioeconomic status, home environment, parent involvement, child self concept and child achievement*. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED206645)
- Rosenbloom, A. F. (2004). High school music studies and social studies: An interdisciplinary approach. *Music Educators Journal, 90*(3), 41-45.
- Sahr, H. (2000). Review of the perceptions of secondary administrators regarding the role of the fine arts curriculum in the total education experience. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 146*, 70-73.
- Schneider, T. W., & Klotz, J. (2000). *The impact of music education and athletic participation on academic achievement*. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Mid-South Educational Research Association (28th, Bowling Green, KY, November 15-17, 2000). (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED448186)
- Shapiro, C., & Bloom, J. S. (1977). *Home environment, self-concept and urban student achievement: A bibliography and review of research*. Trenton, NJ: New Jersey State Department of Education. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED161972)
- Sharman, E. (1981). Impact of music on the learning of young children. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 66-67*, 80-85.
- Shiraishi, I. M. (1997). A home-based music therapy program for multi-risk mothers. *Music Therapy Perspectives, 15*(1), 16-23.
- Simpson, D. J. (1969). The effect of selected musical studies on growth in general creative potential. *Dissertation Abstracts International, 30*, 502A. (UMI No. 6913081)
- Slaughter, D. T., & Epps, E. G. (1987). The home environment and academic achievement of black American children and youth: An overview. *Journal of Negro Education, 86*(1), 3-20.

- Van Asselt, J. (1970). *Music as an aid to teaching German in the elementary schools. final report*. Washington, DC: Office of Education (DHEW), Bureau of Research.
- Vander Ark, S., Nolin, W., & Newman, I. (1980). Relationships between musical attitudes, self-esteem, social status, and grade level of elementary children. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 62, 31-41.
- Walker, R. (1989). What impact does society have on music education? *Re-Thinking Music Education in British Columbia* (pp. 13-21). Victoria, BC: University of Victoria.
- Wyatt, J. G. (2002). Music therapy in correctional and forensic settings. *Music Therapy Perspectives*, 20(2), 79-88.